# State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers and Salespersons August 6, 2019

#### BOARD MEMBERS:

 Dan G. Murphy III, Chairman Kirk A. Davis, Secretary

K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs

Randall Derr, Professional Member

Richard LeBlanc, Agent, Office of Attorney General, on behalf of Zachery Everidge, Office of Attorney General

Steve T. Fretz, Professional Member - Absent Neal L. Hufford Jr., Professional Member Robert M. Shaffer, Department of Transportation Representative

Representative
George F. Mermon, Professional Member
William M. Mohler, Professional Member
Donald J. Stoy, Public Member

Janice Cline, Board Administrator

#### BUREAU PERSONNEL:

Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Board Counsel
Shana M. Walter, Esquire, Board Counsel
Amanda N. Wojciechowski, Board Prosecution Liaison
Glenn P. Masser, Esquire, Board Prosecutor
Carolyn DeLaurentis, Deputy Chief Counsel, Prosecution
 Division
Tara J. Wikhian, Esquire, Board Prosecutor

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

3 \* \* \* 1 State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, 2 3 Dealers, and Salespersons August 6, 2019 4 \* \* \* 5 6 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers, and Salespersons was held on Tuesday, August 6, 2019. G. Murphy III, Chairman, called the meeting to order 10 at 9:29 a.m. K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, 11 Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, was 12 not present at the commencement of the meeting. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited. Roll call 13 was taken. 14 \* \* \* 15 16 Approval of minutes of the June 25, 2019 meeting 17 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 18 Approval of the minutes? 19 MR. SHAFFER: 20 So moved. 21 MR. DAVIS: 22 Second. 2.3 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 2.4 So moved and seconded. 25

Roll call.

2

3

4

5

6

1

Randall Derr, abstain; George Mermon,
aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Richard LeBlanc,
abstain; Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William
Mohler, abstain; Donald Stoy, aye;
Robert Shaffer, aye; and Dan Murphy,
aye.

8

10

11

19

20

21

22

2.4

25

[The motion carried. Randall Derr, Richard LeBlanc, and William Mohler abstained from voting on the motion.]

12

Appointment - Carolyn A. DeLaurentis, Esquire, Deputy

Chief Counsel, Prosecution Division Presentation

15 [Carolyn A. DeLaurentis, Esquire, Deputy Chief

16 Counsel, Prosecution Division, introduced herself and

17 provided a brief summary of her professional

18 background.

Ms. DeLaurentis provided information for the Pennsylvania State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers, & Salespersons for FY 2018-2019, noting that 1,380 cases were opened with 1,372 open cases as of

23 July 1, 2019.

Ms. DeLaurentis noted 158 warning letters, 48 suspension, 10 automatic suspensions, 20 reprimands,

1 | 17 voluntary surrenders, 29 probations, and 17 | revocations.

2.3

Ms. DeLaurentis noted 69 immediate temporary suspensions, in general, for the prosecution division in FY 2018-2019 with 11,359 open cases as of July 1, 2019. She reviewed the last fiscal year, noting that 14,030 cases were opened, which was up from 12,604 the prior fiscal year. She also noted 13,270 closed files the last fiscal year.

Ms. DeLaurentis discussed the Office of General Counsel's Mediation Program, which is at no cost to either party. She stated that the consent agreements will reflect whether the case was resolved through mediation.

Ms. DeLaurentis addressed the Pennsylvania

Justice Network (JNET), where the prosecution division receives an alert when licensees from all of the Boards and Commissions are charged with a crime.

Ms. DeLaurentis commended the Bureau of Enforcement and Investigation (BEI) with regard to immediate temporary suspensions (ITS). She also commended the prosecutors for their great work.

Ms. DeLaurentis commented that mediation cases are not binding or mandatory and will still go before the Board.

Chairman Murphy favored the communication between the departments and the Attorney General's Office over the years and questioned whether there was feedback on the Board's actions. Ms. DeLaurentis noted her work on improving the communications with the Attorney General's Office regarding the status of current cases. As the Attorney General's Office is a criminal justice agency, it cannot share everything. She also noted communications with the Pennsylvania State Police vehicle fraud investigators.

2.3

Chairman Murphy mentioned a roundtable discussion, possibly started by Richard Lebo, that met monthly or quarterly with the different departments, the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation (PennDOT), and Attorney General's Office to discuss issues. He commented that the discussions helped the interactions between the departments with addressing problems.

Chairman Murphy also mentioned an article in the Philadelphia paper that talked about the deal the Attorney General was after, where the Attorney General would be able to help expedite any discipline.

Ms. DeLaurentis agreed to inquire about the roundtable with the prosecutors who have been with the Board at that time.

Chairman Murphy addressed an email from

Ms. Walter in reference to the budget, where too much

money will be coming into the Board. He commented

that too much money coming in is because of licensees,

which means it will put a further burden on the staff.

He suggested putting money into staffing, which would

give the Board the ability to touch more people with

inspections and prosecution.

Ms. Walter stated that the Board was expecting new numbers from the Bureau of Finance at the next meeting. She noted a significant adjustment in the licensee population, specifically a decrease by about 2,000 with a net decrease of about 6,000 licensees since the October numbers. She mentioned that the Board will have more information after the Bureau of Finance and Operations (BFO) presentation.

Ms. DeLaurentis addressed the Pennsylvania
Licensing System (PALS) regarding the ability to
generate different reports. She suggested the Board
advise counsel of any desired aggregate information,
so she could gather those reports.]

\* \*

23 Report of Prosecutorial Division

24 [Glenn P. Masser, Esquire, Board Prosecutor, informed

25 the Board of his departure and expressed his gratitude

```
1 with working with the Board.
```

2 Mr. Masser presented the Consent Agreement for 3 File No. 17-60-012140.]

4 \*\*\*

5 Report of Board Counsel

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

license.

6 | [Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted three

7 hearings scheduled for later in the day, noting the

11:00 a.m. and 12:00 noon hearings were continued. He

9 mentioned the remaining hearing was scheduled for

10 10:00 a.m. He also noted seven final Adjudications

11 and Orders, one proposed Adjudication and Order, a

12 case for deliberation, seven Motions to Enter Default

13 and Deem Facts Admitted, and a petition for review for

14 discussion during Executive Session.

Mr. Ruiz stated House Bill 1172 was signed into
law, now Act 41 of 2019. That act allows licensure by
endorsement and provisional licenses. He explained
that the bill applies to people from out of state with
a license who come to Pennsylvania to obtain a

Mr. Ruiz stated the bill does not really apply to this Board as the Board has no educational or experience requirements. He explained that the bill's intent is to open the door to more licensees coming into Pennsylvania. He commented that every Board has

to create regulations concerning this. As it does not apply to the Board and completely unnecessary, he will try to circumvent drafting a regulation to save the Board money.

Mr. Ruiz addressed provisional licenses that would only deal with a salesperson for the Board. He stated an applicant must sign the application and submit a background check to the Board. He also does not think the provisional license aspect applies to the Board as it concerns qualifications of those from other states. He noted the Board to be unique and will address the Board's regulations to be in compliance.]

14

15 [The Board recessed from 9:59 a.m. until 10:07 a.m.]

16 \*\*\*

17 | Report of Board Chairman

5

6

10

11

12

13

18 | [Dan G. Murphy III, Chairman, referred to a notice

19 | from the United States District Court for the Southern

20 District of Florida Court regarding a class-action

21 lawsuit over the oil consumption and engine that

22 | includes certain persons who purchased or leased new

23 or used Chevy Equinox or GMC Terrain vehicles equipped

24 | with a 2.4-liter Ecotec engine in 2010, 2011, and 2012

25 as well as a certain model in 2015.

Chairman Murphy addressed the Pennsylvania suit regarding faulty cars sold in Pennsylvania, noting that the Attorney General contends the dealer on Frankford Avenue did not even own the vehicles and was involved in that case.

Chairman Murphy referred to the Pennsylvania
Automotive Association (PAA) article, explaining in
more detail their assessment of the Supreme Court
ruling on the General Motors warranty lawsuit that was
overturned by the court and has returned in the
complainants' favor for the Board's review.]

\* \* \*

[Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted that Dean A. Rhone, Case No. I9-60-005628, regarding a Petition for Reinstatement of the Vehicle Salesperson's License did not appear for the hearing.]

\* \* \*

Application Review - Informal Conferences

[The Applicant Review Committee made the following recommendations regarding the following Criminal Conviction Applications: David Mascari, approved with one-year probation; Bailey M. Lobel, denied; Zachary T. Broome, approved with one-year probation; and Dylan Michalek, approved.]

\* \* \*

2.4

```
11
1
   MR. RUIZ:
2
                  Is there a motion to approve the
3
                  recommendations from the informal
                  conferences?
 4
5
   MR. MERMON:
6
                  So moved.
7
   MR. STOY:
                  Second.
9
   CHAIRMAN MURPHY:
10
                  So moved and seconded.
11
                  Roll call.
12
13
14
                  Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,
15
                  aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye;
16
                  Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler,
17
                  aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer,
18
                  aye; and Dan Murphy, aye.
19
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
20
21
   Report of Board Administrator - No Report
22
23
   [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at
24
   10:20 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session
25
   with Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Board Counsel, and Shana
```

```
12
   M. Walter, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the purpose of
1
2
   conducting quasi-judicial deliberations and to receive
   advice of Counsel. The Board returned to open session
3
   at 11:03 a.m.]
4
                               * * *
5
6
   [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
   Professional and Occupational Affairs, entered the
   meeting at during Executive Session.]
9
10
   MOTIONS
11
   MR. RUIZ:
12
                  The Board was just in Executive Session
13
                  conducting quasi-judicial deliberations
14
                  on a number of matters currently pending
15
                  before the Board.
16
                       Is there a motion to approve the
17
                  Consent Agreement at File No. 17-60-
                  012140?
18
19
   MR. MERMON:
20
                  So moved.
21
   MR. DAVIS:
22
                  Second.
2.3
   CHAIRMAN MURPHY:
24
                  So moved and seconded.
25
```

13 Roll call. 1 2 3 Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon, 4 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; 5 Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 6 aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer, 7 aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan 8 Murphy, aye. [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's 10 name is NFI Empire Custom Built Jeeps.] \* \* \* 11 MR. RUIZ: 12 13 Is there a motion to deny the Petition 14 for Reinstatement for Dean A. Rhone at 15 Case No. 19-60-005628? 16 MR. SHAFFER: 17 So moved. MR. DERR: 18 19 Second. 20 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 21 So moved and seconded. 22 2.3 Roll call. 2.4 25 Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,

14 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; 1 Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 2 3 aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer, 4 aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan 5 Murphy, aye. 6 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 7 MR. RUIZ: Is there a motion to approve the 10 following final Adjudications and 11 Grigori V. Abalov, Case No. 16-Orders: 12 60-04044; Douglas McArthur, Case No. 15-1.3 60-02931; Felix Ortiz, Case No. 17-60-14 04364; Cyrus R. Scott Jr., Case No. 17-15 60-09803; Zators Auto Sales, Case No. 16 16-60-07071; Frank P. Fricchione, Case 17 No. 16-60-00127; Donald R. Reed, Case No. 14-60-05609? 18 19 MR. STOY: 20 So moved. 21 MR. DERR: 22 Second. 2.3 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 2.4 So moved and seconded. 25

```
15
                  Roll call.
1
2
3
                  Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,
 4
                  aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye;
5
                  Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler,
6
                  aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer,
7
                  aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan
8
                  Murphy, aye.
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
10
11
   MR. RUIZ:
12
                  Is there a motion to approve the
13
                  proposed Adjudication and Order as the
                  Board's final order in the case of
14
15
                  Rodney A. Harris, File No. 15-60-05672?
16
   MR. MERMON:
                  So moved.
17
   MR. DAVIS:
18
19
                  Second.
20
   CHAIRMAN MURPHY:
21
                  So moved and seconded.
22
2.3
                  Roll call.
2.4
25
                  Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,
```

16 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; 1 Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 2 3 aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer, aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan 4 5 Murphy, aye. 6 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* MR. RUIZ: Is there a motion to direct counsel to 10 draft the final Adjudication and Order consistent with discussions in Executive 11 Session in the case of Brian A. Vergotz 12 at File No. 17-60-02756? 13 14 MR. MERMON: 15 So moved. MR. DAVIS: 16 17 Second. 18 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 19 So moved and seconded. 20 21 Roll call. 22 2.3 Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon, 2.4 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 25

```
17
                  aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer,
1
2
                  aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan
3
                  Murphy, aye.
4
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
5
6
   MR. RUIZ:
                  Is there a motion to grant the Motion to
8
                  Deem Facts Admitted in the cases of
                  Brian Estrella, File No. 17-60-04411;
10
                  Lawrence B. Laken, Case No. 17-60-13131;
11
                  William J. Maguire, File No. 16-60-
12
                  12082; Jason Lee Wissinger, File No. 16-
13
                  60-13572; Marcus Dedan Tolbert, File No.
14
                  19-60-002057; and Robert M. Morris, File
15
                  No. 15-60-06526?
16
   MR. MERMON:
17
                  So moved.
   MR. STOY:
18
19
                  Second.
20
   CHAIRMAN MURPHY:
21
                  So moved and seconded.
22
2.3
                  Roll call.
2.4
25
                  Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,
```

18 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; 1 Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 2 3 aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer, 4 aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan 5 Murphy, aye. 6 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 7 8 MR. RUIZ: 9 Is there a motion to grant the Motion to 10 Enter Default and Deem Facts Admitted in 11 the case of Rafael Levi at File No. 17-60-04410? 12 Robert Shaffer has been recused 13 from all deliberations and voting on 14 15 this matter. MR. MERMON: 16 17 So moved. MR. DAVIS: 18 19 Second. 20 CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 21 So moved and seconded. 22 2.3 Roll call. 24 25 Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,

19 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye; 1 Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler, 2 3 aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer, recuse; K. Kalonji Johnson, ave; and Dan 4 5 Murphy, aye. [The motion carried. Robert Shaffer recused himself 6 from deliberations and voting on the motion.] 9 MR. RUIZ: 10 Is there a motion to grant counsel the 11 authority to settle the Petition for 12 Review in the case of Kurt B. Eichert 13 vs. the State Board of Vehicle 14 Manufactures, Dealers, & Salespersons 15 consistent with discussions in Executive Session? 16 17 MR. MERMON: So moved. 18 MR. JOHNSON: Second. CHAIRMAN MURPHY:

19

20

21

22 So moved and seconded.

2.3

2.4 Roll call.

1 Richard LeBlanc, aye; George Mermon,

2 aye; Kirk Davis, aye; Randall Derr, aye;

Neal Hufford Jr., aye; William Mohler,

aye; Donald Stoy, aye; Robert Shaffer,

aye; K. Kalonji Johnson, aye; and Dan

6 Murphy, aye.

7 [The motion carried unanimously.]

\* \*

9 Report of Acting Commissioner

10 [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, addressed

11 Act 41 of 2019 and how it relates to the Board. He

12 recommended a letter of intent from the Board to

13 Governor Wolf's office stating why the Board is unique

14 compared to other Boards regarding Act 41 of 2019.

15 Acting Commissioner Johnson commented that it

16 | would send a good message to the Governor's Office and

17 | would be a good public affirmation of the Governor's

18 | intent, showing that the Board had been doing it all

19 along.]

4

5

2.0

21 Adjournment

22 CHAIRMAN MURPHY:

Motion to adjourn.

24 MR. JOHNSON:

I move to adjourn.

### CHAIRMAN MURPHY: 1 2 Adjourned. 3 [The State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers, 4 5 and Salespersons Meeting adjourned at 11:10 a.m.] \* \* \* 6 9 CERTIFICATE 10 11 I hereby certify that the foregoing summary 12 minutes of the State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, 13 Dealers and Salespersons meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the 14 15 minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers and 16 17 Salespersons meeting. 18 19 20 2.1 Amber Garbinski, 2.2 Minute Clerk 2.3 Sargent's Court Reporting 2.4 Service, Inc.

## STATE BOARD OF VEHICLE MANUFACTURERS, DEALERS AND SALESPERSONS REFERENCE INDEX August 6, 2019

8	TIME	AGENDA
9	9:29	Official Call to Order
11 12	9:29	Pledge of Allegiance
13 14	9 <b>:</b> 30	Roll Call
15 16	9:30	
17		Approval of Minutes
18 19 20 21	9:30 9:45	Appointment - Carolyn A. DeLaurentis, Deputy Chief Counsel, Prosecution Division Presentation
22 23	9:45	Report of Prosecutorial Division
24 25	9:45	Report of Board Counsel
26 27 28	9:59 10:07	Recess Return to Open Session
29 30	10:07	Report of Board Chairman
31 32 33	10:20 11:03	Executive Session Return to Open Session
34 35	11:03	Motions
36 37	11:08	Report of Acting Commissioner
38 39 40	11:10	Adjournment