



PENNSYLVANIA REDISTRICTING Reform Commission



Appendix 9: Redistricting Reforms in Eight States

Appendix 9: Redistricting Reforms in Eight States

Arizona (2000)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 5-member citizens commission with balanced partisan composition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draws both congressional and state maps. • Ineligible to serve: elected or appointed officials, candidates, political party or campaign officers, or lobbyists. <p>Selection Process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Members of the public apply to Commission on Appellate Court Appointments. • Commission selects 25 nominees (10 Democrats, 10 Republicans, 5 Independents). • Legislative leaders select 4 commissioners. • 4 commissioners select a 5th not registered in the same party as others to serve as chair. 	<p>Maps must begin with a "grid-like pattern," then are adjusted by according to the following criteria:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Contiguous, compact, and respect communities of interest 2) Use visible geographic features, city, town, and county boundaries, and undivided census tracts. 3) Competitive districts are favored where doing so would not significantly detract from the goals above. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Public feedback: Commission issues a draft mapping plan for public comment and receives recommendations from the legislature. 2) Data: Party registration and voting data may not be used in preparing the initial mapping plan but can be used to ensure plans meet above criteria above. 3) Approval: Maps must be approved by the commission with at least three votes.

California (2008 & 2010)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 14-member citizens commission with 5 Democrats, 5 Republicans, 4 Independents</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draws both congressional and state legislative districts • Ineligible to serve: served in candidates for federal or state office, party officers, political consultants, lobbyists, legislative staff, and large political donors, or immediate family members. <p>Selection process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bureau of State Audits selects 60 nominees based on their analytical skills, impartiality, and diversity. • Legislative leaders may each strike 6 people. • 8 commissioners (3 Democrats, 3 Republicans, 2 Independents) selected randomly from the remaining nominees. • First 8 members choose 6 colleagues (2 Democrats, 2 Republicans, 2 Independents), to reflect diversity of the state. 	<p>Must follow rank-ordered criteria, including:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Equal population, compact and contiguous. 2) Preserve political boundaries, neighborhoods, and communities of interest. 3) To the extent higher-priority constraints are not violated, encourage compactness. 4) Where not in conflict with the criteria above, state Senate and Assembly districts must be nested within each other. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Public feedback: Commission is required to hold line drawing at sessions that are open to the public. Commission and the legislature must issue public reports after drawing plans explaining their decisions. 2) Data: Records, redistricting data, and software made available to the public. 3) Approval: Maps must be approved with at least 9 votes (3 Democrats, 3 Republicans, and 3 Independents). 4) Failsafe: Maps are subject to public referendum. If the commission fails to pass a map, or a map is overturned by referendum, the state Supreme Court will select special masters to draw a map. 5) Review: State Supreme Court has exclusive jurisdiction in state court for legal challenges to maps that are passed.

New York (2014)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 10-member appointed citizen commission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Draws congressional and state district maps. ● Ineligible to serve: state legislators, members of Congress, statewide elected official, state officer, employee, or legislative employee, registered lobbyist, political party chair. Spouses of state legislators, members of Congress, or statewide elected official. <p>Selection Process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 8 members appointed by state legislative leaders. ● Remaining 2 members appointed by the first 8 commissioners and cannot be members of the either major political party. ● Members must reflect the diversity of the residents of the state. Appointing authorities should consult with minority voting rights groups about the appointments. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● All districts are required to preserve minority rights, be equally populated, and consist of compact and contiguous territory. ● Districts must not be drawn to discourage competition or to favor/disfavor candidates or parties. ● State districts must take into account the historic and traditional significance of counties. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Public feedback: Commission must hold at least 1 public hearing in 5 pre-determined cities and 7 pre-determined counties. 2) Data: Commission must make draft redistricting plans, relevant data, and related information available to the public for them to review, analyze and comment on during the public hearings. 3) Approval: Plans are approved with at least 7 votes. If no plan receives 7 votes, the plan with the most votes is submitted. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Commission submits plans to the legislature, which approves the final plan. ○ The number of votes required to pass the plan depends on the partisan makeup of the state legislative bodies, as well as way the commission's vote was split. In some cases, only an up/down vote is required; in others, a 2/3 majority is required. ○ Legislature must reject (vote down) two separate sets of redistricting plans before it can amend the commission's proposals. 4) Review: Any registered voter may file a petition for judicial review within 45 days on the grounds that the plan violates federal or state law.

Ohio (2015 & 2018)

State Legislative Mapping Process

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 7-member commission consisting of the governor, state auditor, secretary of state, and 4 members appointed by legislative leadership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Ineligible to serve: current members of congress. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Contiguity; limit political subdivision splits; no dis/advantage to a political party; based on statewide elections, correspond closely to the statewide preferences of the voters; compactness ● State Senate districts must be composed of 3 contiguous house districts 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Public feedback: After introducing a proposed plan, redistricting commission must conduct at least 3 public hearings to seek public input. Members of the public can submit redistricting plans. 2) Approval: Must adopt plan by majority vote that includes two members of each major party. If plan is approved by party-line vote, the plan is effective for 4 years.

Congressional Mapping Process

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 7-member commission consisting of the governor, state auditor, secretary of state, and 4 members appointed by legislative leadership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Ineligible to serve: current members of Congress . <p>Drawing and approval of maps:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 1st, 3rd & 4th attempts by state legislature ● 2nd attempt by 7-member redistricting commission. 	<p>Compactness and contiguity, and limit political subdivision splits</p> <p>If the congressional plan is passed on 4th attempt by a simple majority of the legislature, then the following additional standards apply:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The plan cannot unduly favor or disfavor a political party or incumbents; ● The plan cannot unduly divide counties, townships, or municipal corporations; ● Legislators must attempt to draw districts that are compact; and <p>Legislators must provide a written justification of how the above three standards were met.</p>	<p>Public feedback: Redistricting commission must conduct at least 2 public hearings to seek public input. Members of the public can submit redistricting plans.</p> <p>Approval:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 1st attempt: Plan must be approved by 60% of legislature, including at least 50% of minority party. Subject to gubernatorial veto or citizen veto referendum ● 2nd attempt: Plan must be approved by a majority of the commission with at least 2 votes from the minority party. Approved plan cannot be vetoed ● 3rd attempt: Map must be approved by 60% of legislature, including at least 33% of the minority party. Plan is passed as a bill ● 4th attempt: Legislature passes 4-year plan by simple majority. (Process restarts at the 1st attempt 4 years later.) Plan passed as a bill <p>Review: State Supreme Court has exclusive jurisdiction for legal challenges to congressional plans.</p>

Colorado (2018)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 12-member citizens commissions (4 Democrats, 4 Republicans, 4 Independents)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> One commission draws congressional maps and one draws state legislative maps. Ineligible to serve: Candidates for federal office, former members of state redistricting commission, elected public or party officials, party employees, or lobbyists. <p>Selection process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eligible applicants reviewed by panel of 3 recently retired state judges of differing party affiliation. Judges select by lot pools of 300 Republicans, 300 Democrats and 400 Independents. Judges select pools of 50 Republicans, 50 Democrats, and 50 Independents according to merit criteria. Panel chooses by lot: 2 from each of the 3 pools (6 total). Legislative leaders each select 10 from all qualified candidates, and panel selects 1 from each leader's selections (4 total) + panel selects 2 independent applicants. Members must reflect racial, ethnic, gender, and geographic diversity. 	<p>Congressional plan must: ensure population equality; be contiguous; preserve communities of interest and political subdivisions; be compact; maximize the number of politically competitive districts after adhering to the required criteria and considering the above factors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Anti-Gerrymandering Provision. A plan may not be created to protect incumbents, candidates, or a political party. Protections for communities of color. A plan may not deny or abridge the right of any citizen to vote or dilute a racial or language minority group's electoral influence. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Public feedback: At least 3 public hearings must be held in each congressional district, to be broadcast and archived online. Preliminary plan created by the commission's nonpartisan staff, considering comments from commission and public. After hearing on preliminary plan, staff can create 3 more plans and present them to the commission. Commission can adopt one of the plans presented or request that nonpartisan staff create additional plans or amend plans. Approval: 8 of 12 members, including at least 2 independents, must vote for a plan for it to be approved. Review: State Supreme Court reviews the commission's final plan. If the court finds the plan defective, the commission has 12 days to hold a public hearing and return an amended plan.

Michigan (2018)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 13-member independent commission (4 Democrats, 4 Republicans, and 5 Independents)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draws both congressional and state legislative district plans. • Ineligible to serve: candidates, elected officials, partisan officers, paid partisan consultants/staffers, state legislative employees, lobbyists, other specified state employees, & immediate families. 5-year post-service ban on serving in elective partisan offices. <p>Selection process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applications made public and also mailed to 10,000 randomly selected registered voters. Secretary of State selects by lot 60 Republicans, 60 Democrats and 80 Independents. Legislative leaders may each strike up to 5 applicants. Sec. of State randomly selects the final commission from each pool. 	<p>Must prioritize the following criteria in the order listed: Equal population; Contiguous; Reflect the state's demographic population and communities of similar historical, cultural, or economic interests; no partisan advantage; no dis/advantage to incumbents; local boundaries; Compactness</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Public feedback: Commission holds a minimum of 10 public hearings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Each commissioner is allowed to file one proposal for each type of district. ○ Must hold 5 meetings to receive feedback from the public on the proposals. 2) Data: Mapping plans, data and other materials must be published 3) Approval: At least 7 members must vote to approve, including at least 2 Democrats, 2 Republicans and 2 Independents. 4) Failsafe: If commission fails to adopt a plan by majority vote, commissioners rank the plans, and the plan receiving the most points is adopted, provided at least 2 members of each political party and 2 not affiliated rank the winning plan in their top half. 5) Review: Michigan Supreme Court has jurisdiction over challenges to the plans and may call the commission back to take actions to comply with the court's judgment.

Missouri (2018)*

Who	What	How
<p>Body: Non-partisan demographer draws proposed state legislative maps</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ineligible to serve: Any individual who served in a partisan, elected position during the 4-year period before or after their election. <p>Selection process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State auditor selects at least 3 applicants from the pool of applicants and legislative leaders choose from among those three. If they cannot agree, each leader strikes 1/3 of the applicants and the state auditor selects the demographer by lot. <p>Body: Appointed commissions can modify the proposed maps drawn by the demographer.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Senate map commission: 10-member appointed commission. State committee of each major party nominates 10 members (20 total). From this pool, governor selects five members per party (10-member commission). • House map commission: Congressional district committee of each major party nominates two members per congressional district (16 districts; 32 total). From this pool, governor appoints one member per party per district (16-member commission). 	<p>State demographer must use following criteria, in order of priority: equal population; partisan fairness, defined as parties being able to translate their popular support into legislative representation with about equal efficiency; competitiveness, defined as parties' representation in the state legislature being responsive to changes in the electorate's preferences; contiguous; follow political subdivisions; and compactness</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Demographer files the proposed map with the two Senate and House apportionment commissions. 2) Public feedback: Within 10 days of receiving the proposed map, each commission will schedule at least three public hearings. 3) Modifying the map: Commissions are allowed to amend the demographer's map via a 70 percent vote of the commissioners, provided that the amendments meet the redistricting criteria. 4) Approval: If the commissions make no changes or cannot approve changes to the demographer's map, then the demographer's map is enacted. 5) Review: Any citizen can challenge an approved map in court.

* Congressional lines are drawn by the state legislature and are subject to approval or veto by the Governor.

Utah (2018)

Who	What	How
<p>Body: 7-member citizens commission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draws maps for congressional and state legislative districts • Ineligible to serve: lobbyists, candidates, public or partisan officials, paid partisan consultants and staffers. • Commissioners appointed by the leadership of each major party cannot be affiliated with any political party, have voted in the primary, or have served as a delegate to a party convention. <p>Selection process: Members are chosen by the individual legislative leaders (4), the joint leadership of the major and minor party (2), and the governor (1), whose appointee serves as chair of the commission.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redistricting plans must follow these standards in this order: equal population; minimize divisions of political subdivisions; compactness; contiguity (and allow for ease of transport throughout the district); preserve traditional neighborhoods and local communities of interest; natural and geographic boundaries; and maximize the agreement of boundaries between different types of districts. No dis/advantage to incumbents, candidates or parties. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public feedback: Must hold at least seven public hearings and make available recordings of commission meetings. Public is allowed to submit redistricting plans and comments. • Approval: With at least five votes, the commission submits up to three redistricting plans to the legislature for approval or rejection. The legislature must issue a detailed explanation if it enacts a redistricting plan other than a plan recommended by the commission. • Failsafe: If commission fails to adopt a plan, it must submit at least two to the chief justice of the state Supreme Court for consideration. • Review: Any citizen can challenge an approved map in court.