

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
DEPARTMENT OF STATE
BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS

F I N A L M I N U T E S

MEETING OF:

STATE BOARD OF MASSAGE THERAPY

TIME: 10:33 A.M.

Held at

PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE

2601 North Third Street

One Penn Center, Board Room C

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110

as well as

VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS

Tuesday, November 14, 2023

1 State Board of Massage Therapy
2 November 14, 2023

3
4
5 BOARD MEMBERS:
6

7 Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair,
8 Professional Member
9 Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
10 Professional and Occupational Affairs
11 Linda A. Chamberlain, MS, BSN, RN, CNDLTC, Secretary
12 of Health designee
13 Jessica Nelson, Office of Attorney General designee
14 Dana J. Douglas, LMT
15 Vickiann Hicks, LMT, BCTMB, CCCA
16 Jennifer A. Keth, LMT, CNC, Vice Chair
17 Imelda Alumbro Shade, LMT
18 Bryan Strawser, LMT
19
20

21 BUREAU PERSONNEL:
22

23 Shana M. Walter, Esquire, Board Counsel
24 Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Board Regulatory Counsel
25 Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel
26 Heather J. McCarthy, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor
27 and Prosecution Liaison
28 J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Acting Senior Board
29 Prosecutor
30 Andrea L. Costello, Esquire, Board Prosecution
31 Liaison
32 Julius Zeitlinger, Esquire, Board Prosecutor
33 Paul Keller, Board Administrator
34 Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director,
35 Department of State
36
37

38 ALSO PRESENT:
39

40 Nina M. Kottcamp-Long, LMT, NCMT, Coordinator,
41 Massage Therapy Program/Holistic Health and
42 Wellness, Harrisburg Area Community College
43 Camille Baughman, MA, BSed, LMT, Camille Baughman &
44 Associates
45 Ashley Hernandez, Government Relations Specialist,
46 Federation of State Massage Therapy Boards
47 Bryn Erace, Multi Unit Franchise Owner, Hand & Stone
48 Massage and Facial Spa
49
50

State Board of Massage Therapy
November 14, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51

ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)

- Breanna Eckley, Breeze Massage Therapy and Bodywork, LLC
- Natalie Cook, Associate, McNeese-Winter Group
- Mai Lin Petrino, JD, Director Of Legal and Regulatory Affairs, Federation of State Massage Therapy Boards
- Mark Maurer, Student, Lock Haven University Massage Therapy Program
- Twyla Jones, Manager, Online Programs Section, Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection
- Carolyn Hubert-Black, LMT, Continuing Education Provider OR CHRISTINE HUBER
- Corin Barlow, Regional Director, Hand & Stone Massage and Facial Spa
- Edward Portley Jr., LMT, Just This Side of Heaven Massage & Continuing Education for Massage Therapists
- Jennifer Passenti, M.S., Center Director, Lake Region Center, Lackawanna College
- Shaine Marie Schnurman
- Christine Hooper, Manager, Legislative and Regulatory Affairs, American Massage Therapy Association
- Victoria Lantz

1 ***

2 State Board of Massage Therapy

3 November 14, 2023

4 ***

5 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act,
6 at 9:00 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session
7 with Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the
8 purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations
9 and to receive advice of counsel on the matters upon
10 which the Board would later vote. The Board returned
11 to open session at 10:30 a.m.]

12 ***

13 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State
14 Board of Massage Therapy was held on Tuesday,
15 November 14, 2023. Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT,
16 NCTMB, Chair, called the meeting to order at
17 10:33 a.m.

18 ***

19 Introduction of Board Members/Attendees
20 [Chair Porambo requested an introduction of Board
21 members and attendees.]

22 ***

23 [Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted the
24 meeting was being recorded, and those who continued
25 to participate were giving their consent to be

1 recorded.

2 Mr. Jared also noted the Board entered into
3 Executive Session with Board Counsel to have
4 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of
5 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.]

6 ***

7 Approval of minutes of the September 18, 2023 meeting

8 CHAIR PORAMBO:

9 I'd like to continue on with the
10 approval of the minutes from September
11 18, 2023. I'd like to ask for any
12 changes. Hearing none.

13 I'd like to ask for a motion?

14 MS. NELSON:

15 I'll make the motion.

16 CHAIR PORAMBO:

17 Second?

18 MS. DOUGLAS:

19 I can second that motion.

20 MR. KELLER:

21 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
22 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,
23 aye; Strawser, abstain; Douglas, aye;
24 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

25 [The motion carried. Bryan Strawser abstained from

1 voting on the motion.]

2

3 Regulatory Report

4 [Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Board Regulatory Counsel,
5 addressed 16A-726 to allow massage therapists to
6 practice in cosmetology salons. He noted the Office
7 of General Counsel (OGC) approved the regulation in
8 October 2022 and Office of Attorney General in
9 January 2023.

10 Mr. Davis explained that the regulation has not
11 been published as proposed in the *Pennsylvania*
12 *Bulletin* because they are waiting for the cosmetology
13 portion of it to catch up. He mentioned that
14 cosmetology has its own separate regulation at 16A-
15 4518 but is all based on Cosmetology Law, and the law
16 that was passed said that the regulations would be
17 "jointly promulgated," which means published at the
18 same time.

19 Mr. Davis stated OGC approved the cosmetology
20 portion in June 2023, but the Office of Attorney
21 General gave them a tolling memo in September 2023
22 noting concern from a legal standpoint. He noted his
23 response memo has been under internal review since
24 September 2023 but was approved internally on
25 November 9. He mentioned that he would be sending

1 off cosmetology's response to the Office of Attorney
2 General and believed the cosmetology portion would
3 also be approved.

4 Mr. Davis believed that they would be seeing both
5 regulations published as proposed in the *Pennsylvania*
6 *Bulletin* before the next meeting. He noted it would
7 allow a period of 30 days for public comment on the
8 regulations once it is published as proposed in the
9 *Pennsylvania Bulletin*. He suggested anyone who has a
10 comment to do so once it is published in the
11 *Pennsylvania Bulletin*.

12 Mr. Davis provided updates concerning the
13 schedule of fees. He mentioned having a conversation
14 with policy folks on October 19, noting there is a
15 good chance they would be getting a memo directly
16 from policy probably before the next meeting relating
17 to the \$112 Professional Licensure Augmentation
18 Account (PLAA) reimbursement question that he posed
19 to policy.

20 Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director,
21 Department of State, explained that the memo is still
22 being drafted because there are still ongoing
23 conversations with the governor's office, as well as
24 the Bureau of Finance and Operations over the
25 proposed fee package. He also is hoping to have some

1 updates before the next meeting.]

2 ***

3 Report of Board Counsel

4 Adjudications and Orders

5 MR. HINSEY:

6 Items 4, 5, and 6 on the agenda are
7 Final Adjudications and Orders.

8 Based on Executive Session
9 deliberations, I believe the Board
10 Chair would entertain a motion
11 directing Board Counsel to issue the
12 Final Adjudication and Orders in the
13 matters of agenda item 4, Christopher
14 Strain, Case No. 22-72-003254; agenda
15 item 5, Fuzhou Yang, Case No. 21-72-
16 010518; and agenda item 6, Taylor
17 Dotterer, Case No. 22-72-014727.

18 CHAIR PORAMBO:

19 I'll need a motion.

20 MS. DOUGLAS:

21 I make the motion.

22 CHAIR PORAMBO:

23 I need a second.

24 MR. STRAWSER:

25 I'll second it.

1 MS. NELSON:

2 I recuse on Christopher Strain.

3 MR. HINSEY:

4 With Jessica Nelson being recused,
5 based on Executive Session
6 deliberations, I believe the Board
7 Chair would entertain a motion
8 directing Board Counsel to issue a
9 Final Adjudication and Order in the
10 matter of agenda item 4, Christopher
11 Strain, Case No. 22-72-003254.

12 CHAIR PORAMBO:

13 Motion for item 4?

14 MS. DOUGLAS:

15 I will make the motion to accept.

16 MR. STRAWSER:

17 I second it.

18 MR. KELLER:

19 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
20 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, recuse; Keth,
21 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
22 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

23 [The motion carried. Jessica Nelson recused herself
24 from deliberations and voting on the motion.]

25

1 MR. HINSEY:

2 Based on Executive Session
3 deliberations, I believe the Board
4 Chair would entertain a motion
5 directing Board Counsel to issue the
6 Final Adjudication and Orders in the
7 matter of agenda item 5, Fuzhou Yang,
8 Case No. 21-72-010518, and agenda item
9 6, Taylor Dotterer, Case No. 22-72-
10 014727.

11 CHAIR PORAMBO:

12 I need a motion.

13 MS. NELSON:

14 I'll make the motion.

15 CHAIR PORAMBO:

16 Second?

17 MR. STRAWSER:

18 I'll second it.

19 MR. KELLER:

20 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
21 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,
22 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
23 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

24 [The motion carried unanimously.]

25

1 Report of Board Counsel

2 Proposed Adjudications and Orders

3 MR. HINSEY:

4 Item 7, to which Jessica Nelson is
5 recused, based on Executive Session
6 deliberations, I believe the Board
7 Chair would entertain a motion
8 directing Board Counsel to draft an
9 Adjudication and Order consistent with
10 discussions in Executive Session in the
11 matter of Tamar Ahmed, Case No. 22-72-
12 005932.

13 CHAIR PORAMBO:

14 I need a motion.

15 MS. DOUGLAS:

16 I'll make the motion.

17 CHAIR PORAMBO:

18 Second?

19 MR. STRAWSER:

20 I'll second the motion.

21 MR. KELLER:

22 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
23 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, recuse; Keth,
24 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
25 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

1 [The motion carried. Jessica Nelson recused herself
2 from deliberations and voting on the motion.]

3 ***

4 Report of Board Prosecutors

5 [Andrea L. Costello, Esquire, Board Prosecution
6 Liaison, presented the Consent Agreements for Case
7 Nos. 19-72-014314 & 19-72-014710 and Case No. 23-72-
8 003247 and Case No. 23-72-002069.

9 Ms. Costello informed Board members that this was
10 her last Board meeting.

11 Chair Porambo thanked Ms. Costello and wished her
12 the best of luck.]

13 MR. HINSEY:

14 Based on the presentation of the
15 prosecution division, does any Board
16 member wish to reenter Executive
17 Session for deliberations on any of
18 these matters? Hearing none.

19 Based on Executive Session
20 deliberations, I believe the Chair
21 would entertain a motion to approve the
22 Consent Agreements in the matters of
23 agenda item 8, Case Nos. 19-72-014314 &
24 19-72-014710; agenda item 9, Case No.
25 23-72-002069; and agenda item 10, Case

1 No. 23-72-003247.

2 CHAIR PORAMBO:

3 I'd like to ask for a motion?

4 MS. NELSON:

5 I'll make the motion.

6 CHAIR PORAMBO:

7 Second?

8 MR. STRAWSER:

9 I'll second the motion.

10 MR. KELLER:

11 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;

12 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,

13 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;

14 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

15 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's
16 name at agenda item 8 is Dorel Ionel Lacatus, L.M.T.;
17 item 9, Marco Joseph Rigazio, L.M.T.; and item 10,
18 Berks Medical Massage, LLC.]

19 ***

20 Report of Acting Commissioner

21 [Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
22 Professional and Occupational Affairs, informed Board
23 members that the request for proposal (RFP) for the
24 Pennsylvania Licensing System (PALS) replacement was
25 issued on September 28, 2023, and he would provide an

1 additional update at the next meeting.]

2 ***

3 VICE CHAIR KETH ASSUMED THE CHAIR

4 ***

5 Report of Board Administrator

6 Applications

7 MR. HINSEY:

8 Item 12 on the agenda, with the Board
9 Chair being recused, based on Executive
10 Session deliberations, I believe the
11 Acting Chair would entertain a motion
12 to approve the Application for
13 Licensure as a Massage Therapist at
14 agenda item 12, Celeste Biondo.

15 VICE CHAIR KETH:

16 Could we have a motion to approve,
17 please?

18 MS. NELSON:

19 I'll make the motion.

20 MR. STRAWSER:

21 I'll second the motion.

22 MR. KELLER:

23 Porambo, recuse; Claggett, aye;
24 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,
25 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;

1 Hicks, recuse; Alumbro Shade, aye.
2 [The motion carried. Nancy Porambo and Vickiann
3 Hicks recused themselves from deliberations and
4 voting on the motion.]

5 ***

6 CHAIR PORAMBO RESUMED THE CHAIR

7 MR. HINSEY:

8 Based on Executive Session
9 deliberations, I believe the Chair
10 would entertain a motion to
11 provisionally deny the Applications for
12 Licensure as a Massage Therapist for
13 agenda items 11, Ali Almasri, and item
14 14, Shaine Schnurman.

15 CHAIR PORAMBO:

16 Could we have a motion, please?

17 MS. NELSON:

18 I'll make the motion.

19 CHAIR PORAMBO:

20 Second?

21 MR. STRAWSER:

22 I'll second it.

23 MR. KELLER:

24 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
25 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,

1 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
2 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

3 [The motion carried unanimously.]

4 ***

5 MR. HINSEY:

6 Based on Executive Session
7 deliberations, I believe the Chair
8 would entertain a motion to approve the
9 Application for Licensure as a Massage
10 Therapist at agenda item 13, Arnold
11 Mirza.

12 CHAIR PORAMBO:

13 Could I have a motion, please?

14 MS. NELSON:

15 I'll make the motion.

16 CHAIR PORAMBO:

17 Second?

18 MR. STRAWSER:

19 I'll second it.

20 MR. KELLER:

21 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
22 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,
23 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
24 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

25 [The motion carried unanimously.]

1
2 Miscellaneous - Discussion: MT Licensure via
3 Apprenticeship (Letter from FSMTB and Memo from DOS
4 Policy)

5 [Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted prior
6 Board discussion with Mr. LaFratte and informed
7 everyone that the Board received an internal memo
8 regarding apprenticeships across the country and a
9 letter from the Federation of State Massage Therapy
10 Boards (FSMTB) concerning their view of
11 apprenticeships. He mentioned there is interest in
12 an apprenticeship program in Pennsylvania and
13 exploring that option to further advance licensure of
14 massage therapists in the state of Pennsylvania.

15 Mr. Hinsey explained that an apprenticeship
16 program would require a legislative initiative
17 request performed by the Board to the Department of
18 State Policy Office if the Board decides to move
19 forward.

20 Mai Lin Petrine, JD, Director Of Legal and
21 Regulatory Affairs, Federation of State Massage
22 Therapy Boards, stated FSMTB's position is from the
23 regulatory community with respect to the
24 administrative difficulties in managing
25 apprenticeships. She noted the Board could reach out

1 to Utah and Missouri representatives to discuss
2 challenges that they have sometimes the way
3 apprenticeships have evolved over time. She
4 explained that apprenticeships used to be one-on-one
5 mentoring and are now one mentor with six or eight
6 apprentices, where they begin to move into the
7 massage therapy traditional education route.

8 Ms. Lin Petrine addressed difficulties when the
9 apprentice and the mentor relationship sours and
10 transferring to a new mentor. She believed Utah has
11 three or four different actual pathways, noting the
12 executive director wished they did not have them
13 because they are very difficult to administer and
14 take a lot of time from the board's perspective.

15 Ms. Lin Petrine commented that FSMTB's position
16 is that the MBLEx or an entry-level competence
17 assessment should be a requirement of anybody who
18 wants to practice massage therapy. She mentioned the
19 tangential issue of opening up or exacerbating
20 illicit massage and human trafficking because
21 nefarious actors will take these opportunities and
22 exploit the situation.

23 Ms. Lin Petrine further explained that depending
24 on the regulatory framework for approving mentors, it
25 provides the ability for traffickers and handlers to

1 become mentors and then use the apprenticeship
2 pathway to foster illicit massage and trafficking,
3 which creates another pathway for exploitation and
4 debt bondage. She noted it is kind of creating an
5 indentured servitude pathway via apprenticeships and
6 is another way that traffickers could use to keep
7 therapists in debt.

8 Chair Porambo commented that it would be
9 contingent upon the parameters set by the state with
10 respect to a teacher being approved and the standards
11 set by the policy director and the state. She
12 mentioned that there would be very strict parameters
13 on who can teach.

14 Ms. Lin Petrine explained that every state and
15 regulatory authority does put parameters in place but
16 would also have to look at the state of massage
17 education and massage schools, where there is a lot
18 of oversight, proliferation of fraudulent massage
19 schools and diploma mills. She noted that it is
20 creating another pathway that requires oversight and
21 requires a board that has the administrative capacity
22 and bandwidth to do that in a uniform manner.

23 Ms. Lin Petrine stated one of the difficulties
24 with apprenticeship is uniformity and ensuring that
25 the apprentice program is administered in an

1 objective, uniform way, and part of the lure of
2 apprenticeship is the uniqueness and trying to find
3 that balance from a regulatory perspective can be
4 challenging.

5 Ms. Hicks referred to apprenticeship programs in
6 the medical field that many states are starting to
7 adopt, where education is through a local college as
8 well as job placement and mentorship after. She
9 stated they are done very professionally and even the
10 Department of Labor is asking for it to be done
11 professionally, where the old school apprenticeship
12 of mentoring one-on-one and a journeyman's license no
13 longer exists.

14 Ms. Hicks explained that most states require some
15 sort of a test, noting it is just another path and
16 can also be helpful for job placement and gainful
17 employment, which is something schools have to deal
18 with in the future. She stated it would actually
19 help if it is involved with actual education and does
20 not think the Board is looking for a way out but is
21 looking for another pathway for employment as well as
22 training.

23 Ms. Hicks suggested researching the medical field
24 for nurses and certified nursing assistants (CNAs),
25 where three or four states have adopted similar

1 programs and might be a better model than an old
2 mentorship.

3 Ms. Petrine agreed but noted there is a national
4 consensus on what entry-level massage education and
5 massage therapy encompasses. She stated nursing and
6 the medical profession is more of a hybrid than a
7 true apprenticeship by creating kind of core
8 education with work experience.

9 Ms. Hicks stated the U.S. Department of Labor has
10 a set up for that, as well as the states that would
11 choose to take it on, where there would be a lot of
12 input from each state because every state has a
13 different route to a massage license, but they
14 usually hybrid them with a related training provider
15 and then employment.

16 Ms. Hicks noted it is just a different route to
17 help people get through school and is not for
18 everyone. She commented that many of them have been
19 successful, noting the Board sees cases, where people
20 went to a traditional program and took a traditional
21 test but still do unethical things.

22 Ms. Petrine commented that adding an experience
23 requirement to practice is kind of transforming the
24 entire entry-level massage education pathway, so if
25 someone has to go to school to be able to do an

1 apprenticeship or an internship, they are actually
2 adding a requirement and some might argue that it
3 would be adding a barrier to entry rather than
4 reducing it, depending on the amount of entry-level
5 education required.

6 Ms. Petrine mentioned the importance of having
7 better uniformity in the massage profession about
8 education, where programs vary between 500 and 1000
9 hours, noting the profession needs to decide what
10 education is needed, whether it be an apprenticeship,
11 a hybrid program, or traditional school because there
12 is no consensus on it at this point.

13 Ms. Petrine stated FSMTB's mission is to promote
14 uniformity to allow mobility, but adding all of those
15 unique pathways across the country makes it difficult
16 for people to move around.

17 Mr. LaFratte stated additional information needs
18 to be gathered and the Board should not be detracted
19 by one or two states that did not effectively run
20 their programs. He noted parameters could be set and
21 enforced it to make sure things run properly and
22 smoothly. He recommended having FSMTB's counsel, in
23 conjunction with their policy office,
24 reach out to some of the states that have successful
25 apprenticeship programs already legislatively and

1 consider what works and does not work as they weigh
2 out what to include in a potential bill.

3 Nina M. Kottcamp-Long, LMT, NCMT, Coordinator,
4 Massage Therapy Program/Holistic Health and Wellness,
5 Harrisburg Area Community College, stated there is a
6 movement toward apprenticeships and a group of folks
7 reached out to her who wrote grants for
8 apprenticeships asking about massage therapy. She
9 mentioned having a task force as suggested during a
10 conversation with Ms. Baughman, noting one school in
11 Pennsylvania is using their students as employees and
12 calling it an apprenticeship.

13 Ms. Kottcamp-Long mentioned being familiar with
14 the nurse aide program because her colleague is the
15 coordinator of the nurse aide program for Harrisburg
16 Area Community College, noting they educate about
17 1500 nurse aide students a year. She noted the
18 Department of Education does oversee the nurse aide
19 program and approves every instructor. She believed
20 they need that type of oversight for an
21 apprenticeship and be careful that bad players do not
22 slip into this.

23 Ms. Kottcamp-Long stated the Ashland group
24 approached her and had a grant for apprenticeships,
25 noting the apprenticeship organization was used to

1 writing apprenticeships for welding and electricians
2 at the high school level and decided they wanted to
3 enter into healthcare. She noted an apprenticeship
4 program was just approved in their department for
5 medical assisting (MA). She explained that they
6 would pay the tuition but then the individual must
7 agree to work for an employer, where the employer
8 would give them 32 hours of work during their
9 apprenticeship program and then agree to work 2000
10 hours for the employer.

11 Ms. Kottcamp-Long addressed what that would look
12 like for a massage therapy apprenticeship. She
13 stated employer would employ someone for 32 hours
14 while they were in massage school, which would mean a
15 part-time program, and then at the completion of
16 their education and acquiring of license would have
17 to finish out those 2000 hours. She explained that
18 they would get about 1000 hours while they were in
19 school but still have an obligation to the employer
20 for another 1000 hours, noting their tuition would be
21 paid through the scholarship fund.

22 Ms. Kottcamp-Long noted the importance of
23 understanding what apprenticeships look like, knowing
24 smaller employers may not be able to do that and
25 again suggested having a task force to investigate

1 what an apprenticeship would look like.

2 Camille Baughman, MA, BSed, LMT, Camille Baughman
3 & Associates, also addressed the importance of doing
4 a deep dive and having a task force to be able to
5 move forward. She referred to research from July 1,
6 2020, where the state of Florida just passed a bill
7 doing away with apprenticeship programs. She
8 referred to FSMTB's point regarding the 2000 hours,
9 where it may be more of a barrier for students or for
10 people who are wanting to move forward.

11 Ms. Baughman commented that massage therapy and
12 the medical communities are parallel, but they are
13 not dealing with trafficking and unsavory agents
14 looking to exploit their systems. She noted there is
15 more ability for exploitation of a system when
16 dealing with another layer of bureaucracy and asked
17 who would manage that system because of the amount of
18 time and energy to regulate it. She mentioned there
19 are schools not doing the proper education currently
20 and this would expand it to a whole other ballgame.
21 She requested a copy of the letter from FSMTB.

22 Ashley Hernandez, Government Relations
23 Specialist, Federation of State Boards of Massage
24 Therapy, Federation of State Massage Therapy Boards,
25 offered to share the FSMTB letter.

1 Jennifer Passenti, M.S., Center Director, Lake
2 Region Center, Lackawanna College, provided a comment
3 in chat where she requested being part of the task
4 force.

5 Chair Porambo commented that she could possibly
6 be a member if a task force is created and requested
7 she provide contact information.

8 Twyla Jones, Massage Therapist, Harrisburg, PA,
9 sent a text message asking whether this would allow
10 programs like MPower to return to Pennsylvania.

11 Acting Commissioner Claggett informed Ms. Jones
12 that more research would be needed before the Board
13 would be able to provide a comment.

14 Ms. Hicks addressed the importance of having
15 conversation and having it done through a traditional
16 program. She stated it would be helpful for people
17 who do not have funding and help job placement but no
18 one wants to see a program less than what someone
19 would receive in a traditional 600-hour program.

20 Ms. Hicks referred to comments concerning the age
21 of 18, noting the requirement is 18 or older for most
22 massage programs and did not see that changing with
23 apprenticeships. She suggested looking at medical
24 communities and how that is working when partnering
25 with licensed schools to receive the education side

1 of it. She mentioned that the Florida apprenticeship
2 program was very old, where they never take a test or
3 have formal education and is not the same as hybrid
4 educational and putting someone into the workforce.
5 She also noted the need to set up a committee or wait
6 to see what happens in the next few years with other
7 states that have implemented it.

8 Ms. Kottcamp-Long referred to Ms. Hicks comments
9 concerning the age of 18. She mention being at a
10 workforce summit sponsored by the U.S. Chamber in
11 Adams County, noting their movement toward
12 apprenticeships is for high schools. She stated
13 their laws do not allow massage students to touch
14 people under the age of 18, but there could be
15 portions of massage education that could happen in
16 high school, like the science portion or some of
17 those portions.

18 Ms. Kottcamp-Long clarified that the movement
19 toward apprenticeships is a movement toward high
20 school skill set in the workforce, noting a
21 representative from the U.S. Chamber said they did a
22 whole generation wrong by telling them that they
23 needed a four-year education in order to be
24 successful in the workplace. She reported 50% of
25 seniors in 2023 will not be college-bound and will be

1 looking at skill training.

2 Ms. Kottcamp-Long clarify that there is talk
3 focusing on apprenticeships and getting healthcare
4 apprenticeships in high schools. She believed the
5 movement would happen and some part of massage might
6 be in that movement.

7 Ms. Hicks commented that every state could make
8 it look like what they want, and there is a lot of
9 theory and science that could be done on the front
10 end, and then go to the hands-on portion when they
11 are old enough.

12 Chair Porambo referred to someone who has a
13 cosmetology license and is working on her teacher's
14 license at 17 years old, who was hired as an
15 esthetician, noting that to be a wonderful
16 opportunity.

17 Ms. Hicks commented that someone being in the
18 environment helps them understand the profession even
19 if they cannot do massage therapy like candy strippers
20 who were potential nursing students and learned the
21 basics of being in the hospital settings. She noted
22 having massage students so intrigued with body
23 movement and kinesiology that they went on to be
24 chiropractors or physical therapists.

25 Ms. Costello informed Board members that

1 prosecution encounters issues with jurisdiction over
2 the schools and receive complaints about school
3 programs and others. She noted prosecution also
4 receives complaints about spa jurisdiction over the
5 businesses and cases for them employing unlicensed
6 individuals, where they have a limited scope, aiding
7 and abetting, or employing unlicensed.

8 She also mentioned seeing an increase in case
9 numbers concerning trafficking and prostitution from
10 130 to 170 cases. She also mentioned diploma mills
11 being a big issue and suggested the Board keep those
12 in mind as far as structuring.

13 Acting Commissioner Claggett recommended the
14 Board reach out to other states that have an
15 apprenticeship program and inviting them in front of
16 the Board to have the same discussion.

17 Ms. Hicks asked whether the trafficking is done
18 by licensed or unlicensed facilities posing as
19 massage therapists.

20 Ms. Costello explained that it is hard to say as
21 far as the licensed people they encounter, whether
22 they were someone who went through a diploma mill or
23 whether they legitimately went to school because it
24 would be kind of impossible to know until they get
25 some information on it. She noted there is usually

1 someone license-associated when they go in because
2 they know they need to have a license on the wall.
3 She mentioned that sometimes investigators or law
4 enforcement will go in and a licensed person usually
5 is not there, and the unlicensed people say they
6 were just helping out or just cleaning. She noted
7 they also say they are doing exempt services
8 under Section 13.

9 Chair Porambo thanked everyone for their
10 comments.]

11 ***

12 Public Comment

13 [Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, addressed
14 Shaine Schnurman's questions, noting the Board has
15 decided to provisionally deny their license and they
16 would receive a provisional denial notification with
17 instructions on how to appeal the denial.

18 Ms. Jones provided a comment sharing a story
19 about her son who entered the Harrisburg Area
20 Community College (HACC) certified nursing assistant
21 (CNA) program at 17, noting he was working as a CNA
22 before he was 18. She mentioned there were a few
23 pieces of equipment he was not permitted to use until
24 he was 18 but has been successful in the industry.]

25 ***

1 Report of Board Chair

2 [Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair,
3 addressed her attendance at the Federation of State
4 Massage Therapy Boards Meeting in San Diego,
5 September 28-31. She mentioned that the Federation
6 of State Massage Therapy Boards is comprised of all
7 state boards and agencies that regulate the massage
8 profession with a total of 46 states and territories
9 utilizing the Massage & Bodywork Licensing
10 Examination (MBLEx). She reported 20,000 candidates
11 take the MBLEx annually.

12 Chair Porambo noted 41 of the 45 state regulatory
13 board members attended the meeting and the agenda
14 included introductions, treasurer's report,
15 presentation of the slate of candidates, resolutions
16 and bylaw amendments, a membership quorum, human
17 trafficking and illicit massage, elections and
18 voting, debate on proposed bylaw amendments and
19 resolutions, the MBLEx and how they protect it,
20 sexual harassment in the massage profession and
21 information, and regulatory cases and trends.

22 Chair Porambo reported the FSMTB is very stable
23 financially with a very healthy reserves total as
24 well and over 198,337 volunteer hours were donated to
25 the FSMTB. She noted the Interstate Compact

1 currently has only the state of Nevada adopting the
2 language, three bylaw amendments from California were
3 rejected, one from Washington State passed, and one
4 from California was withdrawn. She mentioned there
5 was considerable debate and controversy regarding the
6 amendments.

7 Chair Porambo addressed the human trafficking
8 discussion that occurred at the conference. She
9 noted human trafficking began as early as 1882 and
10 also during the U.S. Asia-Pacific War, where women
11 were used for comfort stations.

12 Chair Porambo stated they were called rest and
13 relaxation stations after the war when human
14 trafficking increased by 38% in just four years,
15 bringing in \$5 billion per year. She reported
16 typically 6 to 22 buyers per day with \$40-\$60 per
17 visit in facilities. She noted cash business is an
18 80/20 split with 20% for the worker.

19 Chair Porambo stated many come from China, South
20 Korea, Thailand, and Vietnam ages 30 to 60. She
21 noted a term called "sheng nu" for women in their
22 late 20s who are single and unmarried and considered
23 a social shame and used for debt bondage. She noted
24 The Network is working together across disciplines
25 and engages landlords and informs and motivates them

1 to shut places down. She mentioned that additional
2 information could be found at the-network.org.

3 Chair Porambo addressed discussion regarding
4 challenges MBLEx faces with respect to content theft,
5 where thieves support illicit massage. She noted
6 Texas has their own examination, and Alabama is
7 dissolving their state licensure law in October 2024.
8 She mentioned that an Oregon representative indicated
9 their collections of regulatory fines are handled by
10 the Department of Revenue and suggested they consider
11 doing so because it has been successful.

12 Chair Porambo thanked Board members for allowing
13 her to be their representative.]

14 ***

15 Next Meeting Date

16 [Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair, noted
17 the next scheduled Board meeting date is February 13.
18 She also noted the remaining 2024 meeting dates are
19 April 2, June 4, August 13, September 24, and
20 December 3.]

21 ***

22 Miscellaneous - Election of Officers and Committee
23 Members

24 MR. HINSEY:

25 Do we have any nominations for

1 Chairperson?

2 MS. HICKS:

3 I nominate Nancy Porambo.

4 MR. HINSEY:

5 Could we have a vote to make Nancy
6 Porambo the Chairperson the coming
7 year?

8 MS. NELSON:

9 I'll make the motion.

10 MR. STRAWSER:

11 I'll second.

12 MR. KELLER:

13 Claggett, aye; Chamberlain, aye;
14 Nelson, aye; Keth, aye; Strawser, aye;
15 Douglas, aye; Hicks, aye; Alumbro
16 Shade, aye.

17 [The motion carried unanimously.]

18 ***

19 MR. HINSEY:

20 Is there a nomination for the Vice
21 Chairperson?

22 MS. NELSON:

23 I'd like to nominate Jennifer Keth.

24 MR. HINSEY:

25 Jennifer Keth, do you accept the

1 nomination?

2 MS. KETH:

3 I do.

4 MR. HINSEY:

5 Is there a motion to make Jennifer Keth
6 the Vice Chairperson in the coming
7 year?

8 MS. NELSON:

9 I'll make the motion.

10 MR. STRAWSER:

11 I'll second it.

12 MR. KELLER:

13 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
14 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye;
15 Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye; Hicks,
16 aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.

17 [The motion carried unanimously.]

18 ***

19 Adjournment

20 CHAIR PORAMBO:

21 I need a motion to adjourn.

22 MS. NELSON:

23 I'll make the motion.

24 CHAIR PORAMBO:

25 Thank you so much.

[There being no further business, the State Board of
Massage Therapy Meeting adjourned at 11:49 a.m.]

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary
minutes of the State Board of Massage Therapy
Meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my
supervision, and that the minutes accurately
summarize the substance of the State Board of Massage
Therapy Meeting.



Victoria Lantz,
Minute Clerk
Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

STATE BOARD OF MASSAGE THERAPY
REFERENCE INDEX

November 14, 2023

	TIME	AGENDA
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	9:00	Executive Session
9	10:30	Return to Open Session
10		
11	10:33	Official Call to Order
12		
13	10:33	Introduction of Board Members/Attendees
14		
15	10:37	Approval of Minutes
16		
17	10:38	Report of Regulatory Counsel
18		
19	10:44	Report of Board Counsel
20		
21	10:48	Report of Board Prosecutors
22		
23	10:52	Report of Acting Commissioner
24		
25	10:53	Report of Board Administrator
26		
27	10:57	Miscellaneous
28		
29	11:38	Public Comment
30		
31	11:40	Report of Board Chair
32		
33	11:45	Board Meeting Dates
34		
35	11:46	Miscellaneous (cont.)
36		
37	11:49	Adjournment
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		