

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA  
DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS

**F I N A L M I N U T E S**

MEETING OF:

**STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS**

TIME: 10:30 A.M.

Held at

**PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE**

2601 North Third Street

One Penn Center, Board Room C

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110

as well as

**VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS**

Thursday, May 18, 2023

1 State Board of Certified  
2 Real Estate Appraisers  
3 May 18, 2023  
4  
5

6 BOARD MEMBERS:  
7

8 Joseph D. Pasquarella, Chairman, Professional  
9 Member

10 Mark V. Smeltzer Sr., Vice Chairman, Professional  
11 Member - Absent

12 John D. Ausherman, Secretary, Professional Member

13 William T. Stoerrle Jr., Professional Member

14 Michael McFarlane, Professional Member

15 Randy L. Waggoner, Professional Member - Absent

16 Martha H. Brown, Esquire, Secretary of the  
17 Commonwealth designee

18 Paul D. Edger, Esquire, Senior Deputy Attorney  
19 General, Office of Attorney General designee

20 Paul H. Wentzel Jr., Senior Legislative Director,  
21 Department of Banking and Securities designee  
22  
23

24 BUREAU PERSONNEL:  
25

26 Carolyn A. DeLaurentis, Esquire, Executive Deputy  
27 Chief Counsel, Department of State

28 Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Senior Counsel, Counsel  
29 Division

30 Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel

31 Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Board Prosecutor

32 Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator

33 Marc Farrell, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel,  
34 Office of Chief Counsel, Department of State  
35  
36

37 ALSO PRESENT:  
38

39 Chandra Mast, General Commercial Appraiser, Red Rose  
40 Appraisals

41 Scott DiBiasio, Manager, State and Industry Affairs,  
42 Appraisal Institute

43 Emme Reiser, Political Programs Manager, Pennsylvania  
44 Association of Realtors  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

1 \*\*\*

2 State Board of Certified

3 Real Estate Appraisers

4 May 18, 2023

5 \*\*\*

6 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act,  
7 at 9:00 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session  
8 with Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, to have  
9 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of  
10 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations. The Board  
11 returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.]

12 \*\*\*

13 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, informed  
14 everyone that the meeting of the State Board of  
15 Certified Real Estate Appraisers was being held in a  
16 hybrid format, in person and by livestreaming  
17 teleconference, pursuant to Act 100 of 2021, which  
18 requires boards to use a virtual platform to conduct  
19 business when a public meeting is held.

20 Mr. Rouse also noted that the Board entered into  
21 Executive Session with Board Counsel to have  
22 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of  
23 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.]

24 \*\*\*

25 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State

1 Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers was held on  
2 Thursday, May 18, 2023. Joseph D. Pasquarella,  
3 Chairman, Professional Member, officially called the  
4 meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

5 \*\*\*

6 Roll Call/Introduction of Attendees

7 [Joseph D. Pasquarella, Chairman, Professional  
8 Member, requested a roll call of Board members and  
9 introduction of attendees. There was a quorum of  
10 Board members.]

11 \*\*\*

12 Approval of minutes of the April 13, 2023 meeting

13 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

14 Does anyone care to make a motion to  
15 approve the minutes of the April 13  
16 meeting?

17 MR. AUSHERMAN:

18 I make a motion to approve the minutes.

19 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

20 Second?

21 MR. STOERRLE:

22 Second.

23 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

24 Any discussion?

25

1 Joseph Pasquarella, aye; John  
2 Ausherman, aye; William Stoerrle, aye;  
3 Michael McFarlane, aye; Martha Brown,  
4 abstain; Paul Edger, aye; Paul Wentzel,  
5 aye.

6 [The motion carried. Martha Brown abstained from  
7 voting on the motion.]

8 \*\*\*

9 Report of Prosecutorial Division

10 [Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Board Prosecutor, on  
11 behalf of Ray J. Michalowski, Esquire, Senior Board  
12 Prosecutor and Board Prosecution Liaison, had nothing  
13 to report.

14 Mr. Stoerrle noted attending an Association of  
15 Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) Conference and  
16 received a very detailed checklist for whenever there  
17 is a complaint or allegation filed and offered to  
18 provide that the checklist to prosecution. He  
19 mentioned that they also indicated at the AARO  
20 Conference that The Appraisal Foundation (TAF) has  
21 developed free 4-hour courses that specifically  
22 addresses certain areas of deficiency in a workfile.

23 Mr. Ausherman noted he and Mark Smeltzer also  
24 attended the AARO's Conference and concurred with Mr.  
25 Stoerrle that it is an excellent checklist that deals

1 with Standards 2.]

2

\*\*\*

3 Review of Requests

4 MR. ROUSE:

5

Items 7 through 10 on the agenda, the  
6 Review of Requests. These were matters  
7 that were discussed in Executive  
8 Session.

9

10

Items 7, 9, and 10 are the matters  
of Jennifer McGeorge, Susan Rosen, and  
11 Kasey Dowiak.

11

12

Regarding these matters, I believe  
13 the Chair would entertain a motion to  
14 grant the Licensed Appraiser Trainee  
15 Renewal Extension at items 7, 9, and  
16 10.

16

17 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

18

Any Board members care to make that  
19 motion?

19

20 MR. MCFARLANE:

21

So moved.

22 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

23

Second?

24 MR. STOERRLE:

25

I'll second.

1 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

2 Thank you, gentlemen.

3

4 Joseph Pasquarella, aye; John  
5 Ausherman, aye; William Stoerrle, aye;  
6 Michael McFarlane, aye; Martha Brown,  
7 aye; Paul Edger, aye; Paul Wentzel,  
8 aye.

9 [The motion carried unanimously.]

10

\*\*\*

11 MR. ROUSE:

12 Regarding item 8 on the agenda, Thomas  
13 Yanchick, I believe the Chair would  
14 entertain a motion to provisionally  
15 deny the Licensed Appraiser Trainee  
16 Renewal Extension of Thomas Yanchick.

17 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

18 John, would you make that motion,  
19 please?

20 MR. AUSERMAN:

21 I so move.

22 MR. EDGER:

23 Second.

24 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

25 Joseph Pasquarella, aye; John

1                   Ausherman, aye; William Stoerrle, aye;  
2                   Michael McFarlane, aye; Martha Brown,  
3                   aye; Paul Edger, aye; Paul Wentzel,  
4                   aye.

5 [The motion carried unanimously.]

6   \*\*\*

7 Report of Board Counsel - Miscellaneous

8 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, addressed  
9 his attendance at the Appraisal Standards Board  
10 Meeting on May 5, 2023, regarding the fifth exposure  
11 draft of proposed changes to Uniform Standards of  
12 Professional Appraiser Practice (USPAP). He noted  
13 the Appraisal Standards Board (ASB) took questions  
14 from the public, reviewed written comments, and voted  
15 to adopt the fifth exposure draft.

16           Mr. Rouse informed Board members that the fifth  
17 USPAP exposure draft would contain a  
18 nondiscrimination section of the Ethics Rule and  
19 contain an Advisory Opinion 39, which would show how  
20 the Fair Housing Act, Equal Credit Opportunity Act,  
21 and Civil Rights Act of 1866 are relevant to  
22 appraisal practice

23           Mr. Rouse stated Advisory Opinion 39 would also  
24 provide examples of how certain actions can violate  
25 the laws. He noted Advisory Opinion 39 would also



1 explain the concepts of disparate treatment and  
2 disparate impact.

3         Mr. Rouse also informed Board members that  
4 Advisory Opinion 40 would be added to provide  
5 guidance related to the prohibition of using  
6 particular protective characteristics in developing  
7 an opinion of value for residential real property  
8 assignments and in the research, analysis and  
9 reporting of location-related data. He noted  
10 Advisory Opinion 40 would also provide examples of  
11 code words that could be identified as a pretext for  
12 discrimination.

13         Mr. Rouse addressed changes to definitions in  
14 USPAP with the retiring of "assignment elements,"  
15 "misleading," and "relevant characteristics." He  
16 mentioned the current definitions for "appraiser,"  
17 "personal inspection," and "workfile" would be  
18 modified. He reported the amended version of USPAP  
19 would be effective January 1, 2024, but would be  
20 available in the fall of 2023. He also mentioned  
21 that this version of USPAP would not have an end  
22 date.]

23   \*\*\*

24 Addendum to the Agenda  
25 MR. ROUSE:

1           There was information that was provided  
2           by The Appraisal Foundation that just  
3           came out yesterday, and I would like to  
4           ask if the Board would vote to add one  
5           item to the agenda.

6                     I am asking if the Chair would  
7           entertain a motion to add "second  
8           exposure draft of the proposed changes  
9           to the AQB criteria" to the agenda.

10 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

11                     Martha, do you want to make that  
12           motion?

13 MS. BROWN:

14                     I'll make that motion.

15 MR. AUSERMAN:

16                     I second.

17 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

18                     Joseph Pasquarella, aye; John  
19                     Auserman, aye; William Stoerrle, aye;  
20                     Michael McFarlane, aye; Martha Brown,  
21                     aye; Paul Edger, aye; Paul Wentzel,  
22                     aye.

23 [The motion carried unanimously.]

24                                     \*\*\*

25 Report of Board Counsel - Miscellaneous

1 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, addressed  
2 the second exposure draft of changes to the Appraiser  
3 Qualifications Board (AQB) criteria to make fair  
4 housing a required component for appraisers'  
5 qualifying and continuing education. He noted a copy  
6 of the second exposure draft could be found at  
7 [www.appraisalfoundation.org](http://www.appraisalfoundation.org) on The Appraisal  
8 Foundation (TAF) website. He also noted to submit  
9 written comments to the second exposure draft to  
10 [www.surveymonkey.com/r/AQBComments](http://www.surveymonkey.com/r/AQBComments) by June 17, 2023.

11 He informed Board members that verbal comments would  
12 be accepted at AQB's next virtual meeting on June 22,  
13 2023. He noted a webinar would also take place on  
14 June 1, 2023.

15 Mr. Rouse stated the second exposure draft would  
16 require credentialed appraisers to successfully  
17 complete a course that meets the content requirements  
18 for the valuation and fair housing laws and  
19 regulations course outline that the AQB is producing  
20 and would be required every 2 calendar years. He  
21 stated it would be a 7-hour course the first time the  
22 credentialed appraiser takes the course and then  
23 would be a 4-hour course every 2 years.

24 Mr. Rouse stated appraiser candidates would take  
25 an 8-hour course on valuation bias and fair housing

1 laws, which would be the 7-hour course plus an  
2 examination. He mentioned that the second exposure  
3 draft recommends changing the 7-hour national USPAP  
4 course to be renamed the 7-hour National USPAP  
5 Continuing Education Course. He noted it also  
6 proposes to change the 7-Hour Instructor  
7 Recertification Course to the name Instructor  
8 Recertification Course.

9 Chairman Pasquarella thanked Mr. Rouse for  
10 informing the public and providing the opportunity to  
11 participate in the responses.]

12 \*\*\*

13 Regulations/Statute

14 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, reported no  
15 changes regarding the status of regulations.]

16 \*\*\*

17 Matters for Discussion - Mass Appraisals

18 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, addressed  
19 his attendance at The Appraisal Foundation's State  
20 Regulatory Advisory Group Meeting, noting the  
21 president of The Appraisal Foundation stated he had a  
22 conversation with the International Association of  
23 Assessing Officers (IAAO) and discussed the issue of  
24 mass appraisals. He mentioned that appraisers have  
25 to meet an experience requirement to become

1 certified.

2 Mr. Rouse explained that AQB criteria states  
3 that mass appraisals is one of the items that could  
4 be used to meet the experience requirement but is not  
5 something that could be used to meet the experience  
6 requirement in Board regulations. He reported that  
7 half of the states do not allow mass appraisal as a  
8 way of fulfilling the experience requirement and that  
9 the Appraisal Subcommittee would be asking states why  
10 it is now allowed.

11 Mr. McFarlane commented that mass appraisals are  
12 typically conducted by assessors in Pennsylvania and  
13 licensed and certified Pennsylvania evaluators but  
14 not exclusively true because certified general  
15 residential appraisers may also complete mass  
16 appraisals. He stated the definition of a mass  
17 appraisal is pretty well-defined by USPAP, whereby a  
18 valuation of a universal property as opposed to an  
19 individual property conducted in accordance with the  
20 standards of USPAP 5 and 6 using specifically viable  
21 standardized techniques that produce credible  
22 assignment results.

23 Mr. McFarlane stated Pennsylvania is considered  
24 a base year jurisdiction or state, meaning there is  
25 no legislation or statute that compels counties

1 within the Commonwealth to conduct a mass appraisal.

2 He recommended the Board consider allowing mass  
3 appraisal experience for those individuals who do  
4 materially participate in mass appraisal output in  
5 consideration for either a certified residential  
6 appraisal license or a certified general appraisal  
7 license.

8 Mr. McFarlane noted § 36.204 allows certified  
9 Pennsylvania evaluators to complete individual  
10 appraisal assignments for the purposes of ad valorem  
11 taxation only. He suggested that any individual who  
12 might assert experience related to either the output  
13 of mass appraisal in which they materially  
14 participate or conduct individual appraisals related  
15 to § 36.204 regulations for ad valorem assignments  
16 only be considered as far as experience hours.

17 Chairman Pasquarella asked how someone would  
18 document their work for the Board's review.

19 Mr. McFarlane explained that there is a mass  
20 appraisal experience log similar to a licensed  
21 trainee experience log that includes property  
22 assignments and the number of hours.]

23

\*\*\*

24 Matters for Discussion - Hybrid Inspections

25 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, informed

1 Board members that Mr. Smeltzer requested Board  
2 discussion regarding hybrid inspections but is not  
3 present, and the Board agreed to table the matter  
4 until the next meeting.

5 Mr. Rouse stated accepting mass appraisals would  
6 require a regulatory change but would bring that back  
7 at the next meeting to be amended in one of the  
8 existing regulations.]

9

\*\*\*

10 Report of Board Chairman - No Report

11

\*\*\*

12 Report of Board Administrator - No Report

13

\*\*\*

14 Conference Reports - No Reports

15

\*\*\*

16 Exploratory Committee

17 [Michael McFarlane, Professional Member, addressed  
18 ASC grants, noting the package of information was  
19 discussed and submitted to the Appraisal Subcommittee  
20 per the notice of funding availability instructions  
21 and is in the preapplication phase for a new round of  
22 grant funding. He informed Board members that he  
23 would report back to the Board with any new  
24 information.]

25

\*\*\*

1 Public Comment/Discussion

2 [Chandra Mast, General Commercial Appraiser, Red Rose  
3 Appraisals, commented that one of the issues of not  
4 moving forward with mass appraisals is that it is  
5 difficult to have discussion regarding development  
6 and how to get to valuation of mass appraisals. She  
7 noted the language is difficult among appraisers  
8 because they are very fixed on matched pair  
9 methodology and has to be thrown completely out when  
10 talking about mass appraisals.

11 Ms. Mast commented that it is a methodology that  
12 so many appraisers are stuck on when talking about  
13 mass appraisals that they are going to have to talk  
14 to other hedonic asset specialists to get the  
15 conversation started. She also applauded Board  
16 efforts regarding USPAP because so few appraisers  
17 have brokerage backgrounds, and there is so little  
18 fair housing education for appraisers.

19 Mr. Stoerrle asked when the Practical  
20 Applications of Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA) would  
21 be rolling out changes and where the state is in the  
22 process.

23 Mr. Rouse explained that they are still working  
24 through the regulatory process, along with a number  
25 of other states that have been experiencing snags in



1 the regulatory process.]

2 \*\*\*

3 Adjournment

4 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

5 Do I have a motion to adjourn this  
6 meeting?

7 MR. WENTZEL:

8 So moved.

9 MR. AUSERMAN:

10 Second.

11 CHAIRMAN PASQUARELLA:

12 The meeting is now adjourned.

13 \*\*\*

14 [There being no further business, the State Board of  
15 Certified Real Estate Appraisers Meeting adjourned at  
16 11:03 a.m.]

17 \*\*\*

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting.



Derek Richmond,  
Minute Clerk  
Sargent's Court Reporting  
Service, Inc.

STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS  
REFERENCE INDEX

May 18, 2023

	TIME	AGENDA
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10	9:00	Executive Session
11	10:30	Return to Open Session
12		
13	10:30	Official Call to Order
14		
15	10:30	Roll Call
16		
17	10:30	Introduction of Public Attendees
18		
19	10:35	Approval of Minutes
20		
21	10:35	Report of Prosecutorial Division
22		
23	10:37	Review of Requests
24		
25	10:38	Report of Board Counsel
26		
27	10:42	Addendum to the Agenda
28		
29	10:42	Report of Board Counsel (cont.)
30		
31	10:47	Regulations/Statute
32		
33	10:47	Matters for Discussion
34		
35	10:56	Exploratory Committee
36		
37	10:57	Public Comment/Discussion
38		
39	11:03	Adjournment
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		