January 9, 2023

State Board of Auctioneer Examiners

Nevin B. Rentzel, AU, Chairman, Professional Member - Absent

Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs

Sherman E. Hostetter Jr., AU, Professional Member

Gerald A. Rader, AU, Professional Member Daniel A. Trace, AU, Secretary, Professional Member Hayley Dull, Consumer Protection Agent, Office of Attorney General

BUREAU PERSONNEL:

BOARD MEMBERS:

Jason E. McMurry, Esquire, Board Counsel Carolyn DeLaurentis, Deputy Chief Counsel, Prosecution Division

J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Board Prosecution Liaison

Terrie Kocher, Board Administrator

Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Executive Policy Specialist, Department of State

Deena Parmelee, Legal Office Administrator 1, Department of State

ALSO PRESENT:

George A. Michak, Esquire, Michak Legal

1 2 State Board of Auctioneer Examiners 3 January 9, 2023 * * * 4 5 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 10:00 a.m. the Board entered into Executive 6 7 Session with Jason E. McMurry, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations and to receive legal advice on matters 10 that are currently pending before the Board. 11 Board returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.] * * * 12 13 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State 14 Board of Auctioneer Examiners was held on Monday, 15 January 9, 2023. Daniel A. Trace, AU, Secretary, Professional Member, called the meeting to order at 16 17 10:30 a.m. and asked for a moment of silence.

18

19 Introduction of Board Members/Attendees

20 | [Secretary Trace requested an introduction of Board

21 members and attendees.

22 **

23 Approval of minutes of the November 14, 2022 meeting

24 SECRETARY TRACE:

We have the meeting minutes from the

```
4
1
                  previous session. Anybody have any
2
                  questions?
3
                       We are looking for a motion to
 4
                  approve the minutes from the November
5
                  meeting.
6
   MR. HOSTETTER:
7
                  So moved.
8
   MR. RADER:
9
                  Second.
10
   SECRETARY TRACE:
11
                  Any discussion? Roll call vote.
   MS. KOCHER:
12
13
                  Arion Claggett, abstain; Sherman
14
                  Hostetter, aye; Gerald Rader, aye;
15
                  Daniel Trace, aye; Hayley Dull,
16
                  abstain.
17
   [The motion carried. Arion Claggett and Hayley Dull
18
   abstained from voting on the motion.]
                              * * *
19
20
   Report of Prosecutorial Division
21
   [J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Board Prosecution
22
   Liaison, presented the Consent Agreement and Order
23
   for Case Nos. 19-64-001395, 19-64-001776, 19-64-
24
   003495, and 19-64-009885.
25
   MR. MCMURRY:
```

```
At this time, we look for a motion to
1
2
                  approve the Consent Agreement as
3
                  presented by the prosecution division.
4
   MR. HOSTETTER:
5
                  So moved.
   MR. RADER:
6
7
                  Second.
8
   SECRETARY TRACE:
9
                  Call the vote.
10
   MS. KOCHER:
11
                  Arion Claggett, aye; Sherman Hostetter,
12
                  aye; Gerald Rader, aye; Daniel Trace,
13
                  aye; Hayley Dull, aye.
14
   [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's
15
   name is James J. Whelan.]
16
17
   Report of Board Counsel
18
   [Jason E. McMurry, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted the
19
   Board met in Executive Session for the purpose of
20
   conducting quasi-judicial deliberations and to
21
   discuss matters on the agenda.
22
        Mr. McMurry informed Board members that they are
23
   still moving forward with the general revision
24
   regulations and continuing to move into the final
25
   piece of regulations for licensure by endorsement.
```

6 1 He stated the fee regulations have been approved and 2 posted on the Board's website, which would be in 3 effect for the upcoming renewal cycle.] 4 5 Report of Board Counsel - Application MR. MCMURRY: 6 The Board met in Executive Session. 8 this time, I would ask to see if there 9 is a motion to approve the Application 10 as listed on the agenda. 11 MR. HOSTETTER: 12 So moved. 13 MR. MCMURRY: 14 Is there a second? 15 MR. RADER: 16 Second. 17 MS. KOCHER: 18 Arion Claggett, aye; Sherman Hostetter, 19 aye; Gerald Rader, aye; Daniel Trace, 20 aye; Hayley Dull, aye. 21 [The motion carried unanimously. The Apprentice 22 Auctioneer Applicant's name is Bradley Mummert.] 23 Report of Acting Commissioner - No Report 24

```
1 Report of Board Administrator
```

- 2 | [Terrie Kocher, Board Administrator, reminded
- 3 everyone that the Board is currently in a renewal
- 4 period from December 28, 2022, until February 28,
- 5 2023, when licenses expire. She mentioned there is
- 6 no longer a 30-day grace period, and anyone who does
- 7 | not renew their license on time would have to go
- 8 through the online reactivation process, along with
- 9 paying a late fee of \$5 per month. She reported the
- 10 system is working and renewals have been going
- 11 smoothly.
- 12 Acting Commissioner Claggett commented that other
- 13 | boards still send out notifications when the renewal
- 14 period opens to all applicants.]
- 15 *
- 16 Report of Board Chairperson
- 17 | [Daniel A. Trace, AU, Secretary, Professional Member,
- 18 informed Board members that the 2023 Pennsylvania
- 19 Auctioneers Association's Annual Conference and Trade
- 20 Show starts January 10, 2023. He noted the Auction
- 21 | Competition Farm Show would be on Wednesday, Annual
- 22 | Fun Auction on Thursday, and Annual President's
- 23 Banquet on Friday.
- 24 Mr. Trace reported that no one has to be a member
- 25 of the Pennsylvania Auctioneers Association (PAA) to

1 take action this year but is required to be an
2 auctioneer.]

* *

3

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

4 Appointment - Prosecution Division Annual Report
5 Presentation

6 [Carolyn A. DeLaurentis, Esquire, Deputy Chief 7 Counsel, Prosecution Division, presented to the Board to provide a summary of the prosecution division's annual numbers during 2022. She informed Board 10 members that the Bureau of Professional and 11 Occupational Affairs provides administrative and 12 legal support to all 29 boards and commissions, along 13 with the counsel division, hearing examiners, and 14 Bureau of Enforcement and Investigation (BEI).

Ms. DeLaurentis noted there is also a Professional Compliance Office that reviews the complaints to make sure they have jurisdiction. She stated the professional licensing aspect protects the health and safety of the public as well as the integrity of the profession, and the prosecution division is tasked with making sure people are following laws related to their specific license.

Ms. DeLaurentis explained that the Office of Chief Counsel is under the Governor's Office of General Counsel and is broken into several divisions.

She noted the prosecution division has about 33
attorneys and over 60 staff members who work on
complaints with the Bureau of Enforcement and
Investigation and the Professional Compliance Office.
She announced Karl Geschwindt would be serving as an acting senior prosecutor as of today.

- Ms. DeLaurentis addressed the complaint process and how a complaint is received, noting every single case is reviewed by an administrative assistant to determine jurisdiction. She noted receiving Pennsylvania Justice Network (JNET) alerts through the Office of Administration. She stated they have investigative authority with over 70 investigators and 30 inspectors who interview witnesses and gather the facts so a lawyer can review the information.
- Ms. DeLaurentis discussed levels of review, including whether the case is under their jurisdiction and other reviews to make sure time and money should be spent on the case. She noted cases can be closed if no violation is found, but they may file an order to show cause (OSC) or issue citations if violations are found.
- Ms. DeLaurentis stated the respondent is entitled to a hearing if charged and provided a summary of the hearing process, noting the hearing examiner's

decision is a proposed decision and then the Board makes a final decision. She mentioned that the consent agreement process is where both sides are negotiating toward a resolution.

Ms. DeLaurentis explained that BEI conducts interviews, inspections, and obtains evidence but also serve documents and testify. She addressed document authority, noting boards are supposed to comply based upon their governing regulations and statutes if BEI asks to see their records, but there are limitations if they do not have the authority to be there.

Ms. DeLaurentis stated BEI gives the information to the attorneys after the investigation to decide whether to close the case or issue a warning letter. She noted that disciplinary actions include immediate temporary suspension if someone is an immediate danger to the health and safety of the public. She stated automatic suspensions usually concern drug act violations or 302 commitments, and a petition for appropriate relief is when someone has violated a board order.

Ms. DeLaurentis referred to § 3109, where investigations by their office are confidential and privileged under confidentiality statutes. She

informed Board members that prosecution cannot disclose something within their files if it is not contained within the document presented to the Board. She explained that investigations are defined as noncriminal investigations under the Right-to-Know Law and are exempt from requests under that law. She reported that only their final action can be shared publicly.

Ms. DeLaurentis provided data as of January 3, 2023, noting the number of current open cases for the whole division is 13,154. She stated 16,084 cases were opened in 2022 and is down from 2021 at 18,363 cases. She reported closing 17,826 files in 2022 and is up from 2021, where 15,994 cases were closed. She thanked the prosecution and counsel divisions for their hard work in 2022.

Ms. DeLaurentis addressed specific information for the State Board of Auctioneer Examiners, noting 91 cases were opened in 2022, which is down from 2021 at 119. She reported 112 cases were closed in 2022 and 129 in 2021 with 95 cases that are currently open for the Board. She stated 13 cases resulted in fines, 5 Act 48 citations, 1 cost, and 4 suspensions.

Ms. DeLaurentis mentioned that non-disciplinary actions are called Z codes, and the Board had 38

cases that were Z02s, where prosecution was not
warranted. She reported 35 warning letters in 2022,
which is down from 2021 at 53. She mentioned that de
minimis violations may be a reason the Board would
have more warning letters in a renewal year.

Mr. Hostetter asked whether the Board could receive the report showing a breakdown of categories of complaints.

Ms. DeLaurentis stated the information would be available to the boards when their annual report is finalized and goes to the General Assembly. She mentioned that Board Counsel could request specific aggregate information that is available for all of the boards and offered to have her assistant provide that information to Mr. McMurry today.

Mr. Rader commented that other professionals have bonds similar to auctioneers and asked if it ever gets to a point where a bond would actually be in jeopardy.

Mr. McMurry explained that the commonwealth does not go after the bond and only ensures that they are bonded to protect the public, where someone injured by the actions of the licensee could take legal action.

Ms. DeLaurentis stated individuals are asked to

speak to their own counsel when they are facing
discipline because they do not know what insurance
companies will and will not do based on their
disciplinary actions and may be analogous to the
bonding situation.

Mr. McMurry further explained that someone may have other insurance covering them running a business but that it is not required as part of a licensure aspect. He stated auctioneers in the commonwealth are required to be bonded, and that bond is issued in favor of their license.

Mr. Rader asked Ms. DeLaurentis how the internet influenced prosecution.

Ms. DeLaurentis stated the Pennsylvania Licensing System (PALS) is beneficial because it makes filing a complaint online with their office easy. She mentioned the internet to also be helpful as an investigative tool to look at what licensees are putting out to the public on social media.]

20 ***

[Daniel A. Trace, AU, Secretary, Professional Member, noted the remaining 2023 meeting dates are March 13,

23 May 8, July 10, September 11, and November 13.]

24 ***

25 Adjournment

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

```
14
 1
   SECRETARY TRACE:
 2
                  We look for a motion for adjournment.
 3
   MR. HOSTETTER:
 4
                   So moved.
 5
   SECRETARY TRACE:
 6
                  Second?
 7
   MR. RADER:
                   Second.
 9
   SECRETARY TRACE:
10
                  All those in favor? Any opposed?
                               * * *
11
12
    [There being no further business, the State Board of
13
   Auctioneer Examiners Meeting adjourned at 11:14 a.m.]
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```


CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Auctioneer Examiners meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Auctioneers meeting.

Michele Ann McGinnis,

Minute Clerk

Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.