1	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
2	DEPARTMENT OF STATE
3	BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS
4	
5	FINAL MINUTES
6	
7	MEETING OF:
8	
9	STATE REAL ESTATE COMMISSION
10	
11	TIME: 11:30 A.M.
12	
13	BOARD ROOM B
14	One Penn Center
15	2601 North Third Street
16	Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110
17	
18	December 3, 2019
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

		2
1234567890112345678901222222222223333335678901234567890 1121111112222222222223333356789012344567890 50	State Real Estate Commission December 3, 2019	
	COMMISSION MEMBERS:	
	Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member Anne M. Rubin, Vice Chair, Industry Member Joseph J. McGettigan, Secretary, Industry Member Alexis L. Barbieri, Esquire, Public Member Armand N. Ferrara Jr., Industry Member Jennifer Thomson, Esquire, Attorney General Designee Annie Hanna Cestra, Industry Member Edward L. Seebeck, Cemetery Member - Absent Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Public Member K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs	
	COMMISSION PERSONNEL:	
	Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission Counsel Ray Michalowski, Esquire, Commission Prosecution Liaison Angela B. Lucci, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Alice Glasser, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Krista Linsenbach, Commission Administrator	
	ALSO PRESENT:	
	William McFalls Jr., ABR, CRS, Green, GRI, President, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors Alex Charlton, Director of Public Policy and Political Affairs, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors Wayne C. Crawford, Esquire, Public Policy Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors	1

3 * * * 1 2 State Real Estate Commission 3 December 3, 2019 * * * 4 5 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State Real 6 Estate Commission was held on Tuesday, December 3, 7 2019. Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, officially called the meeting to order at 11:30 a.m. 8 9 A roll call was taken. The Pledge of Allegiance was 10 recited. * * * 11 12 Approval of Minutes of the October 23, 2019 meeting CHAIR TARANTINO: 13 Can I have a motion for the approval of 14 15 the draft minutes? MS. BARBIERI: 16 17 So moved. MR. MCGETTIGAN: 18 19 Second. 20 CHAIR TARANTINO: 21 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 22 Any opposed? 23 [The motion carried. Mr. Piccirilli abstained from 24 voting on the motion.] 25 * * *

Report of Prosecutorial Division 1 2 [Angela B. Lucci, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor, 3 presented the Consent Agreements for File No. 18-56-003197 and File No. 19-56-008577.] 4 * * * 5 6 [Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor, 7 presented the Consent Agreements for File No. 17-56-8 05302 and File No. 18-56-011084.] 9 * * * 10 [Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor, 11 withdrew the Consent Agreement for Case Nos. 15-56-12 01863 & 17-56-13110. 13 Mr. Fritsch presented the Consent Agreement for Case Nos. 16-56-12500, 18-56-010755, & 18-56-010906.] 14 * * * 15 16 [Ray Michalowski, Esquire, Commission Prosecution 17 Liaison, introduced Alice Glasser, Esquire, as a new 18 additional prosecuting attorney for the Commission.] * * * 19 20 Report of Commission Counsel 21 [Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission Counsel, noted 22 three cases for discussion during Executive Session 23 and a reinstatement hearing scheduled for 1:30 p.m.] * * * 24 25 Report of Commission Chair

4

[Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, thanked 1 2 everybody for their support over the past year and 3 wished Ms. Rubin good luck as the 2020 Chairperson. Chair Tarantino welcomed Mr. Piccirilli back to 4 5 the Real Estate Commission. Chair Tarantino also noted this to be 6 7 Ms. Barbieri's last meeting and wished her good luck.] 8 * * * 9 Report of Commission Administrator 10 [Krista Linsenbach, Commission Administrator, updated 11 the Commission on renewals, stating that education provider renewals closed as of November 30, 2019, with 12 13 almost 100 percent response. She noted property 14 renewals opened on October 4, 2019, and cemetery 15 company registrations opened on November 20, 2019. 16 Ms. Linsenbach informed the Commission that the 17 grace period for renewal next year will be going away, 18 and any license that expires starting January 1, 2020, 19 will not be granted a grace period. She noted this 20 begins with cemetery company registrations that expire 21 January 31, 2020. Ms. Linsenbach stated, any time 22 after the expiration date, a full reactivation will be 23 required.] 24 * * * 25 Public Session

5

[William McFalls Jr., ABR, CRS, Green, GRI, President, 1 2 Pennsylvania Association of Realtors, addressed the 3 in-house legal hotline that began in June. He stated two attorneys were hired in addition to the Director 4 5 of Law & Policy, Hank Lerner, and Standard Forms 6 Manager, Desiree Brougher, to respond to member calls. 7 Mr. McFalls noted receiving thousands of calls and starting a detailed tracking of those topics. He 8 9 mentioned rental and property management issues were 10 among the top call categories, along with inspection 11 contingency of the agreement of sale and seller 12 disclosure issues.

Mr. McFalls also noted many calls regarding Commission-related issues and hoped some of the application resources the Commission was developing would help clarify many of these license-related questions rather than forwarding callers to the Pennsylvania Association of Realtors (PAR).

Mr. McFalls addressed a recent update regarding broker price opinion regulations, where it will be moving out of the Commission and to the next phase of the process.

23 Mr. McFalls also addressed an update regarding 24 general regulatory review, especially team 25 advertising, noting PAR will be working closely with

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 the Commission to move that forward.

2 Mr. Ruiz mentioned that Wayne Crawford from PAR 3 attended the latest committee meeting, where all of 4 the regulations were reviewed and would be brought up 5 to date.

6 Mr. McFalls reflected on his 30 years in the 7 industry, commenting that most of the changes were for 8 the better. He mentioned his travel throughout the 9 state over the last couple of years and discussions with many realtors, brokers, and local association 10 11 There was a belief that the lack of executives. 12 response and timeliness to complaints had created an atmosphere where the risk posed by violating the law 13 14 was low compared to the penalty and likelihood of 15 being caught.

Mr. McFalls noted this disrespect of the industry 16 17 to be upsetting and frustrating to many who love this 18 business. He commented that the cost or loss of a 19 license was not applied in a manner that gets the 20 attention of the licensee anymore and believed more 21 enforcement with significant fines and license 22 revocations would get the licensees' attention. 23 Mr. McFalls addressed a recent circumstance for 24 those involved with the Bright Multiple Listing

25 Service (MLS) in the marketplace and then uniquely

1 followed by the National Association of Realtors (NAR) 2 regarding the process of MLS rules and regulations. 3 He mentioned a \$5,000 fine getting everyone's 4 attention and noticed properties advertised on 5 Facebook or social media are now in the MLS the next 6 day.

7 Mr. McFalls commented that PAR will continue to 8 advocate for improvements that provide more timely 9 adoption of regulations and policies, create 10 efficiency and accuracy within the Pennsylvania 11 Licensing System (PALS), and effective communication 12 between the Department of State and the licensees.

Mr. McFalls thanked the Commission for the opportunity to speak publically and privately on behalf of PAR for the last couple of years and for their service to the industry as he moves aside as president.

18 Chair Tarantino requested Mr. Falls relate to PAR 19 comments made by prosecution, noting the fines in the 20 thousands. The Commission may take a while to catch 21 an individual, but violators will be fined when 22 caught.

23 Mr. McFalls mentioned a monthly report the 24 Commission used to offer of individuals who were fined 25 and will look into PAR developing something similar

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 because of their resources in communication and the 2 in-house legal hotline.

3 Mr. McFalls referred to a presenter at one of the 4 sessions who questioned why the broker was not 5 involved in the process.

6 Mr. McFalls stated the problem in the industry 7 right now was part-time brokers who do not care. Нe noted discussion concerning team legislation not being 8 on track, but the reality was their responsibility was 9 10 given to the teams. He stated the whole idea of 11 promulgating that legislation was to try to make sure 12 members are doing the right thing for the consumer, 13 and until a fine was uniquely heard, the general 14 member out on the street was not seeing it or feeling 15 it.

Ms. Rubin suggested PARJustListed daily emails have a link to all of that once a month to keep the information in front of the face of the realtor community.

20 Mr. McGettigan requested PAR's support because of 21 their power and means to changes and put pressure on 22 the administration for more people where the 23 Commission needs them.] 24 *** 25 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

12:05 p.m. the Commission entered into Executive 1 2 Session with Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission 3 Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations on matters currently pending before the 4 5 Commission and to receive the advice of counsel. The 6 Commission returned to open session at 1:33 p.m.] * * * 7 8 [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, entered the 9 10 meeting during Executive Session.] * * * 11 12 [A Formal Hearing was held from 1:33 p.m. until 13 1:49 p.m. in the Matter of the Petition for 14 Reinstatement of Licensure of Tesha Keefer, Case No. 15 19-56-014824.] * * * 16 17 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 18 1:49 p.m. the Commission entered into Executive 19 Session with Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission 20 Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial 21 deliberations on matters currently pending before the 2.2 Commission and to receive the advice of counsel. The 23 Commission returned to open session at 1:51 p.m.] * * * 24 25 MOTIONS

10

1 MR. RUIZ: 2 The Commission was just in executive 3 session conducting deliberations on the matter of the Petition for Reinstatement 4 5 of Tesha Keefer, Case No. 19-56-014824. 6 Is there a motion to grant 7 reinstatement? 8 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 9 So moved. CHAIR TARANTINO: 10 11 Second? MS. RUBIN: 12 13 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 14 15 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 16 Any opposed? 17 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 18 19 MR. RUIZ: 20 Is there a motion to reject the Consent 21 Agreement at File No. 18-56-003197 as 22 being too lenient? 23 MR. FERRARA: 24 So moved. 25 CHAIR TARANTINO:

12 Second? 1 2 MR. JOHNSON: 3 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 4 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 5 6 Any opposed? 7 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 8 MR. RUIZ: 9 10 Is there a motion to deny the Consent Agreement at File No. 19-56-008577 for 11 12 not having enough information for the Commission to make a determination? 13 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 14 15 So moved. 16 CHAIR TARANTINO: 17 Second? MS. CESTRA: 18 19 Second. 20 CHAIR TARANTINO: 21 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 22 Any opposed? 23 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 24 25 MR. RUIZ:

1 Is there a motion to approve the Consent Agreement at File No. 17-56-05302? 2 3 MS. BARBIERI: So moved. 4 5 CHAIR TARANTINO: Second? 6 7 MR. JOHNSON: 8 Second. 9 CHAIR TARANTINO: 10 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 11 Any opposed? 12 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's name is Gerald B. Pilgrim.] 13 * * * 14 MR. RUIZ: 15 16 Is there a motion to deny the Consent 17 Agreement at File No. 18-56-011084 as being too lenient? 18 19 MS. RUBIN: 20 So moved. 21 CHAIR TARANTINO: 22 Second? 23 MR. JOHNSON: 24 Second. 25 CHAIR TARANTINO:

14 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 1 2 Any opposed? 3 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 4 MR. RUIZ: 5 Is there a motion to reject the Consent 6 7 Agreement at File Nos. 16-56-12500, 18-8 56-010755, & 18-56-010906 as being too 9 lenient? 10 MS. RUBIN: 11 So moved. 12 CHAIR TARANTINO: Second? 13 MS. CESTRA: 14 15 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 16 17 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 18 Any opposed? 19 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 20 21 MR. RUIZ: 22 Is there a motion to grant the Motion to 23 Enter Default in the case of Anthony 24 Joseph Coulter, Case No. 17-56-012729? 25 MS. RUBIN:

15 So moved. 1 2 CHAIR TARANTINO: 3 Second? MR. JOHNSON: 4 5 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 6 7 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 8 Any opposed? 9 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 10 11 MR. RUIZ: 12 Is there a motion to grant the Petition for Reconsideration and issue an amended 13 14 order in the case of Fayez Antonios at 15 File No. 14-56-01132, consistent with our discussions in executive session? 16 17 MR. MCGETTIGAN: So moved. 18 19 CHAIR TARANTINO: 20 Second? 21 MR. FERRARA: 22 Second. 23 CHAIR TARANTINO: 24 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 25 Any opposed?

16 1 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 2 3 MR. RUIZ: 4 Is there a motion to deny the request to 5 lessen the civil penalty in the case of 6 Lois Glass at File No. 12-56-10604 & 12-7 56 - 10773? 8 MR. PICCIRILLI: 9 So moved. 10 CHAIR TARANTINO: Second? 11 12 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 13 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 14 15 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 16 Any opposed? [The motion carried unanimously.] 17 * * * 18 Education/Examination Committee 19 20 MS. RUBIN: 21 I make a motion that Anne M. Demutis-22 Cummins be approved to sit for her 23 broker exam. 24 CHAIR TARANTINO: 25 Second?

17 1 MS. CESTRA: 2 Second. 3 CHAIR TARANTINO: 4 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 5 Any opposed? 6 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 7 8 MS. RUBIN: 9 I make a motion that the following 10 courses be approved for CE: Strategies 11 and Tips for Working with Millennials, 12 Running a Small Brokerage Firm, Performing Quality BPOs, National USPAP 13 14 Update 2020-2021, Millennials: 15 Challenging the Norm, and How to Build a 16 Successful Commercial Real Estate 17 Business. CHAIR TARANTINO: 18 19 Second? 20 MS. CESTRA: 21 Second. 22 CHAIR TARANTINO: 23 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 24 Any opposed? 25 [The motion carried unanimously.]

18 * * * 1 2 MS. RUBIN: 3 I make a motion to deny the course 4 Become a Real Estate Social Media Super 5 Star. We are asking for a new title to that. The content is satisfactory, but 6 7 the title is misleading. 8 CHAIR TARANTINO: 9 Second? 10 MS. CESTRA: 11 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 12 13 On the question, all in favor, say aye. Any opposed? 14 15 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 16 17 MS. RUBIN: 18 A motion to deny the course Commercial 19 Real Estate 101 as the course discusses 20 commission rates. 21 CHAIR TARANTINO: 22 Second? 23 MS. BARBIERI: 24 Second. 25 CHAIR TARANTINO:

19 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 1 2 Any opposed? 3 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 4 MS. RUBIN: 5 6 Again, denying the course Wowing Your 7 Customers and Clients. Content is 8 acceptable, but the title is misleading. 9 We would like them to submit with a new 10 title. CHAIR TARANTINO: 11 12 Second? MS. BARBIERI: 13 14 Second. 15 CHAIR TARANTINO: 16 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 17 Any opposed? 18 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 19 20 Enforcement (Application Review) Committee 21 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 22 For the record, the application of 23 Jessica Page Miller, who was due for an 24 informal conference today, was tabled. * * * 25

1 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 2 I'd like to make a motion that the 3 application of Joel Deserio be approved with no restrictions. 4 5 CHAIR TARANTINO: Second? 6 7 MS. BARBIERI: 8 Second. 9 CHAIR TARANTINO: 10 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 11 Any opposed? 12 [The motion carried unanimously.] 13 * * * MR. MCGETTIGAN: 14 15 I'd like to make a motion that the 16 applications of Rajneesha S. Preston, 17 Kevin Robert Kress, and Tanveer Singh 18 Ghuman be approved and their licenses 19 placed on probation through their 20 criminal probation and/or restitution. 21 CHAIR TARANTINO: 22 Second? 23 MR. FERRARA: 24 Second. 25 CHAIR TARANTINO:

21 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 1 2 Any opposed? 3 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 4 5 Report of Commission Counsel - Report of the Rules & 6 Regulations Committee 7 [Armand Ferrara, Industry Member, stated the committee recently met and spent many hours on the advertising 8 portion of the rules and regulations, as well as 9 10 reviewing the whole packet. He noted the committee 11 will need to continue to work on advertising and BPO 12 details at the January 30, 2020 meeting. 13 Ms. Linsenbach questioned whether the second day 14 and second overnight for the meeting had been 15 approved. Acting Commissioner Johnson gave his 16 approval with the caveat that request for the second 17 day and overnight still needed to be run through the fiscal office. 18 19 Mr. Ruiz also added that Act 41 regulations were 20 worked on as well, stating that the regulations will 21 also be moving forward once the Commission develops a 22 process to apply the regulations. He noted the 23 advertising piece to be the biggest hurdle going 24 forward. He mentioned that BPO temporary regulations 25 have moved out of their office to the Office of

Budget, Office of Policy and Planning, and Office of 1 2 General Counsel (OGC). Once those are published as temporary regulations, the formal process will begin. 3 It was noted that Mr. Ferrara, as the 4 5 Commission's Association of Real Estate License Law 6 Officials (ARELLO) representative, will be reaching 7 out and gathering information from that. Mr. Michalowski was commended for his preparation 8 9 work and the information supplied for review before 10 the meeting. 11 Ms. Linsenbach noted the Commission meeting on Wednesday, January 29, 2020, and the regulatory 12 13 meeting following day on January 30, 2020.] * * * 14 15 Miscellaneous 16 [Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, noted the 17 2020 Commission meeting dates.] * * * 18 Report of Acting Commissioner 19 20 [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, informed the 21 2.2 Commission that voicemail has been instituted into the 23 phone system to help with wait times and to ensure a 24 more expeditious application processing time. He also 25 stated all of the Boards and Commissions have access

to voicemail during holidays and evenings. The self-1 2 help aspect related to status updates and simple 3 licensing questions was still being developed. 4 Acting Commissioner Johnson updated the 5 Commission on the guide, noting that real estate should be active this month for brokers and 6 7 salespeople with the plan to gradually expand the 8 quides to include all licensee classes. 9 Acting Commissioner Johnson referred to the guides, which are now called navigators, as 10 11 information for individuals seeking licensure in the 12 Commonwealth to better prepare their application, cut down on the processing time, and apprise the 13 14 applicants as to the expectations with all three 15 phases of the process. He mentioned that the 16 navigators will be updated guarterly and should 17 provide individuals with a relatively easier 18 experience.] * * * 19 20 Adjournment 21 CHAIR TARANTINO: 2.2 I wish you all a great holiday season. 23 See you in January. The meeting is 24 adjourned. 25 * * *

[There being no further business, the State Real Estate Commission Meeting adjourned at 2:06 p.m.] * * * CERTIFICATE I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Real Estate Commission meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Real Estate Commission meeting. Sm. Hyun Soo Lee, Minute Clerk Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.

1 2 3		STATE REAL ESTATE COMMISSION REFERENCE INDEX
3 4 5 6		December 3, 2019
7	TIME	AGENDA
8 9	11:30	Official Call to Order
10 11	11:30	Roll Call
12 13	11:30	Pledge of Allegiance
14 15	11:31	Approval of Minutes
16 17	11:31	Report of Prosecutorial Division
18 19	11:46	Report of Commission Counsel
20 21	11:47	Report of Commission Chair
22 23	11:48	Report of Commission Administrator
24 25	11:50	Public Session
26 27 28	12:05 1:33	Executive Session Return to Open Session
29 30 31	1:33 1:49	Formal Hearing - Tesha Keefer
32 33 34 35	1:49 1:51	Executive Session Return to Open Session
36	1:52	Motions
37 38	1:55	Report of Committees
39 40	2:02	Miscellaneous
41 42	2:03	Report of Acting Commissioner
43 44	2:06	Adjournment
45 46		
47 48		
49 50		