# State Real Estate Commission September 10, 2019

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anne M. Rubin, Vice Chair, Industry Member Joseph J. McGettigan, Secretary, Industry Member Alexis L. Barbieri, Esquire, Public Member Armand N. Ferrara Jr., Industry Member

Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member

Jennifer Thomson, Esquire, Attorney General Designee Annie Hanna Cestra, Industry Member - Absent Edward L. Seebeck, Cemetery Member - Absent K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of

Professional and Occupational Affairs

#### COMMISSION PERSONNEL:

Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission Counsel Ray Michalowski, Esquire, Commission Prosecution Liaison

Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Tiffany A. Raker, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Krista Linsenbach, Commission Administrator

#### ALSO PRESENT:

William McFalls Jr., ABR, CRS, Green, GRI, President, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors
Wayne C. Crawford, Esquire, Senior Legal Counsel, Republican Research, House Professional Licensure Committee, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors
Alex Charlton, Director of Public Policy and Political

Affairs, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors Malik Thornton

3 \* \* \* 1 State Real Estate Commission 2 3 September 10, 2019 \* \* \* 4 5 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State Real 6 Estate Commission was held on Tuesday, September 10, 2019. Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, officially called the meeting to order at 11:30 a.m. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited. A roll call was 10 taken. K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, 11 Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, was 12 not present at the commencement of the meeting. 13 \* \* \* 14 [Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, noted that 15 the hearing scheduled for today at 1:30 p.m. has been 16 continued.1 \* \* \* 17 18 Approval of minutes of the July 23, 2019 meeting 19 CHAIR TARANTINO: 20 Can I get a motion to approve the draft 21 minutes for July's meeting? 22 MS. RUBIN: 2.3 So moved. 2.4 CHAIR TARANTINO: 25 Second?

```
MR. FERRARA:
1
2
                  Second.
3
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
 4
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
5
                  Any opposed?
6
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                              * * *
8
   Report of Prosecutorial Division
   [Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor,
10
   presented the Consent Agreements for File No. 16-56-
   01032 and File No. 17-56-05302.]
11
                              * * *
12
13
   [Timothy Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor,
14
   presented the Consent Agreements for Case Nos. 17-56-
15
   06822, 16-56-06304 & 19-56-006528.]
16
17
   [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
18
   Professional and Occupational Affairs, entered the
19
   meeting at 11:40 a.m.]
20
                              * * *
   Report of Commission Counsel
21
22
   [Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission Counsel, noted one
23
   proposed Adjudication and Order, two final
24
   Adjudications and Orders, a Motion to Enter Default,
25
   and a case for deliberation for discussion during
```

5

Executive Session. 1

Mr. Ruiz mentioned two formal hearings scheduled 2 3 for later in the meeting, noting the hearing scheduled

\* \* \*

for 1:30 p.m. had been continued.]

5

6 Report of Commission Chair

[Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, noted

meeting date changes for 2020. He also noted the next

meeting is scheduled for October 23, 2019, in

10 Philadelphia.

11

Report of Acting Commissioner 12

13 [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of

14 Professional and Occupational Affairs, informed the

15 Commission that renewals for education providers

recently opened. He noted extra time being allowed 16

17 for renewals.

18 Acting Commissioner Johnson thanked the

Commission for assuring compliance with the provisions 19

20 of Act 41, which went into effect on August 29,

21 allowing out-of-state endorsement for active licensees

22 in other jurisdictions.]

2.3

24 Report of Commission Administrator

[Krista Linsenbach, Commission Administrator, 25

addressed education provider renewals, noting one waiting for her review.

Ms. Linsenbach recognized the Commission staff for their hard work in decreasing the application processing time to one to two weeks.]

\* \* \*

7 Public Session

1

2

3

4

5

6

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

8 | [William McFalls Jr., ABR, CRS, Green, GRI,

9 President, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors,

10 stated the Pennsylvania Association of Realtors (PAR)

11 | will be working to pass House Bill 523 regarding the

12 Private Road Act. He commented that federally backed

13 mortgages were having difficulty with closing on

14 properties located on private roadways if a Private

15 Road Maintenance Agreement was not in place.

Mr. McFalls noted that PAR was hearing from realtors throughout the state, both rural and urban, with this problem. He stated Pennsylvania lacks statutory requirements for private roadways, but House Bill 523 would amend the Private Road Act to provide basic maintenance for a private roadway in the absence of an agreement between homeowners. He described the state-wide basic agreement as simply providing shared responsibility among all homeowners along the roadway unless any prewritten agreement states otherwise.

Mr. McFalls stated PAR worked over several legislative sessions to pass this bill to allow some real estate agents to conduct broker price opinions (BPOs), which was already allowed in almost every other state. He commented that the General Assembly passed House Bill 863 in June of 2018, Governor Wolf signed it a few days later, and it went into effect on August 28, 2018. He mentioned that PAR and its 35,000 members were still waiting for the Commission to issue the required temporary regulations on broker price opinions, which means licensees are being blocked from performing a service for interested clients.

Mr. McFalls noted his concern that real estate schools are offering the prerequisite coursework based on the Commission-approved outline and statements at an earlier Commission meeting that these courses would be acceptable without actually being able to inform licensees of the regulations. He also noted the difficulty in understanding and explaining the delay.]

[Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 11:50 a.m. the Commission entered into Executive Session with Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial

deliberations on matters currently pending before the

\* \* \*

Commission and to receive the advice of counsel. 1 The 2 Commission returned to open session at 1:52 p.m.] 3 4 [K. Kalonji Johnson, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of 5 Professional and Occupational Affairs, exited the 6 meeting during Executive Session.] \* \* \* 7 8 MOTIONS MR. RUIZ: 10 The Real Estate Commission was just in 11 Executive Session conducting 12 quasi-judicial deliberations on a number 1.3 of matters currently pending before the Commission. 14 15 Is there a motion to approve the 16 Consent Agreements at File No. 16-56-01032 and Case Nos. 17-56-06822, 16-56-17 06304 & 19-56-006528? 18 19 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 20 So moved. 21 CHAIR TARANTINO: 22 Second? 2.3 MS. BARBIERI: 24 Second.

25

CHAIR TARANTINO:

```
9
                  On the motion, all in favor, say aye.
1
2
                  Any opposed?
3
   [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's
   name is for File No. 16-56-01032 is Linda Gavio. The
5
   Respondents' names for Case No. 17-56-06822 and Case
   Nos. 16-56-06304 \& 19-56-006528 is Peter A. Hewett and
6
   Northampton County Regional Realty, LLC & Theresa M.
8
   Calantoni.]
                               * * *
   MR. RUIZ:
10
11
                  Is there a motion to deny the Consent
12
                  Agreement at File No. 17-56-05302 as
13
                  being too lenient?
14
   MR. FERRARA:
15
                  So moved.
16
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
17
                  Second?
   MS. BARBIERI:
18
19
                  Second.
20
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
21
                  On the motion, all in favor, say aye.
22
                  Any opposed?
23
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
2.4
   MR. RUIZ:
25
```

10 Is there a motion to direct Commission 1 2 counsel to draft a final Adjudication 3 and Order consistent with discussions in Executive Session in the case of Raymon 4 5 Collins Harris at File No. 15-56-008071? 6 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 7 So moved. 8 CHAIR TARANTINO: 9 Second? 10 MR. FERRARA: 11 Second. 12 CHAIR TARANTINO: 13 On the question, everybody in favor, say 14 aye. Any opposed? 15 [The motion carried unanimously.] 16 17 MR. RUIZ: 18 Is there a motion to approve the final 19 Adjudication and Order in the case of 2.0 Christina M. Sica at Case No. 17-56-2.1 08607 and Nancy J. Steranka-Dickson & 22 Resi-Comm Realty Services, Inc., at Case 2.3 Nos. 15-56-05791 & 15-56-05792? 2.4 CHAIR TARANTINO: 25 Motion to approve?

```
11
 1
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
 2
                  So moved.
 3
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
                   Second?
 4
   MS. RUBIN:
 5
 6
                   Second.
 7
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
 8
                   On the question, all in favor, say aye.
 9
                   Any opposed?
10
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
11
   MR. RUIZ:
12
13
                  Is there a motion to grant the Motion to
                   Enter Default and Deem Facts Admitted in
14
15
                   the case of Lindsay Yetter and Y Real
16
                   Estate, Inc., at File Nos. 14-56-14533 &
17
                   14-56-14534?
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
18
                  Motion?
19
20
   MS. RUBIN:
21
                   So moved.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
22
23
                  Second?
24
   MR. FERRARA:
25
                  Second.
```

```
12
 1
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
 2
                   On the question, all in favor, say aye.
 3
                   Any opposed?
 4
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
 5
 6
   MR. RUIZ:
                   Is there a motion to grant the License
 8
                   Application for Ginger Siobhan Coleman
 9
                   at File No. 19-56-006524?
10
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
11
                   So moved.
12
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
                   Second?
13
   MS. BARBIERI:
14
15
                   Second.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
16
17
                   On the question, all in favor, say aye.
18
                   Any opposed?
19
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
20
21
   Education/Examination Committee
                               * * *
22
23
   MS. RUBIN:
24
                   The Education Committee met and reviewed
25
                   the Broker Exam Application for Kari
```

13 Elizabeth Panza, and we are 1 2 preliminarily denying it as she does not 3 meet the experience requirements. CHAIR TARANTINO: 4 5 Second? 6 MS. BARBIERI: 7 Second. 8 CHAIR TARANTINO: 9 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 10 Any opposed? 11 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 12 MS. RUBIN: 13 14 For the Application for a CE course 15 Digital Marketing: Creating Leads in 16 our Online World, we move to deny it as 17 it does not meet the CE requirements. 18 The contents focuses on marketing. 19 CHAIR TARANTINO: 20 Second? 21 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 22 Second. 2.3 CHAIR TARANTINO: 24 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 25 Any opposed?

```
14
1
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
2
3
   MS. RUBIN:
 4
                  For the CE course for Drones, Nannycams,
5
                   <u>Security Cameras:</u> Privacy Issues and
6
                  Ethical Considerations for Real Estate
                   Professionals, we move to approve this
8
                   course.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
10
                  Second?
11
   MR. FERRARA:
12
                  Second.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
13
14
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
15
                  Any opposed?
16
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
17
   MS. RUBIN:
18
19
                  For the course Managing a
20
                  Multigenerational Business, we deny as
21
                   it does not meet the CE requirements.
22
                   It is focused on recruiting.
2.3
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
24
                  Second?
25
   MS. BARBIERI:
```

15 Second. 1 2 CHAIR TARANTINO: 3 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 4 Any opposed? 5 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 6 7 MS. RUBIN: For the course Social Media: Instagram 9 Business Account, we recommend denying 10 as it does not meet the CE requirements 11 and focuses on marketing. CHAIR TARANTINO: 12 Second? 13 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 14 15 Second. 16 CHAIR TARANTINO: On the question, all in favor, say aye. 17 18 Any opposed? 19 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 20 21 MS. RUBIN: 22 For the course The NEW Real Estate 2.3 Market Understanding the Influential 2.4 Impact of Generational Trends, we move 25 to approve the course.

```
16
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
1
2
                  Second?
3
   MS. BARBIERI:
4
                  Second.
5
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
6
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
7
                  Any opposed?
   [The motion carried. Mr. McGettigan opposed the
   motion.]
10
                               * * *
11
   MS. RUBIN:
12
                  On the course the Ultimate REALTOR App:
13
                  Realtors Property Resource (RPR), we
14
                  deny that as it does not meet the CE
15
                  requirements. Its product is specific
16
                  to realtors only.
17
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
                  Second?
18
19
   MR. FERRARA:
20
                  Second.
21
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
22
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
23
                  Any opposed?
24
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
25
```

17 1 MS. RUBIN: 2 On the course Understanding Procuring 3 Cause in Real Estate, we are denying the course. It is slanted toward realtor 4 5 specific. We recommend modifying it to 6 teach more to buyer agency in general. 7 CHAIR TARANTINO: Second? 9 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 10 Second. CHAIR TARANTINO: 11 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 12 13 Any opposed? 14 [The motion carried unanimously.] 15 16 Enforcement Committee (Informal Conferences) MR. MCGETTIGAN: 17 The Enforcement Committee met this 18 19 morning and conducted informal 2.0 conferences and reviewed applications. 2.1 I would like to make a motion that the 22 application of Christian Mark Will be 2.3 approved with no barrier. 2.4 CHAIR TARANTINO: 25 Second?

```
18
1
   MR. FERRARA:
2
                  Second.
3
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
 4
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
5
                  Any opposed?
6
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
                  I make the motion that we approve to
10
                  place the licenses on probation through
11
                  criminal probation and/or payment of
12
                  restitution for Desiree Q. Walker,
                  Nicole Amanda Mahoney, Tucker A. Glick,
13
14
                  Staci Emilia Clark, and Austin Elliot
15
                  Dructor.
16
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
17
                  Do I have a second?
   MS. BARBIERI:
18
19
                  Second.
20
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
21
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
22
                  Any opposed?
23
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
24
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
25
```

```
19
                  We had one informal conference tabled,
1
2
                  and we had one no show and will pass
3
                  them back to the Commission.
                               * * *
 4
5
   Enforcement Committee (Application Reviews)
6
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
                  We reviewed the following Application
8
                  for Licensure of Shilvosky Buffaloe.
                  make a motion that we approve the
9
10
                  application with no barriers.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
11
                  Second?
12
   MS. RUBIN:
13
14
                  Second.
15
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
16
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
17
                  Any opposed?
18
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
19
20
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
21
                  The application of Rebecca Jean Straley.
                   I move for no barrier toward licensure.
22
2.3
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
24
                  Second?
25
   MS. RUBIN:
```

20 Second. 1 2 CHAIR TARANTINO: 3 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 4 Any opposed? 5 [The motion carried unanimously.] \* \* \* 6 7 MR. MCGETTIGAN: I make a motion that the application of 9 Mary Jane Milich-Pagan be approved with 10 no barrier toward licensure. CHAIR TARANTINO: 11 12 Do I have a second? MR. FERRARA: 13 14 Second. 15 CHAIR TARANTINO: 16 On the question, all in favor, say aye. 17 Any opposed? 18 [The motion carried. Ms. Thomson opposed the motion.] \* \* \* 19 20 MR. MCGETTIGAN: 21 I make a motion that the application of 22 Joel Deserio be denied and advise the 2.3 applicant of the right to an informal 24 conference. 25 CHAIR TARANTINO:

```
21
                  Second?
1
2
   MS. BARBIERI:
3
                  Second.
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
4
5
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
6
                  Any opposed?
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
8
9
   MR. MCGETTIGAN:
10
                  I make a motion that the application of
11
                  James Crowley Jr. be preliminarily
12
                  denied and advise the applicant of the
                  right to an informal conference.
13
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
14
15
                  Do I have a second on that?
   MR. FERRARA:
16
                  Second.
17
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
18
19
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
20
                  Any opposed?
21
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
22
2.3
   Miscellaneous
24
   [Joseph Tarantino, Chair, Industry Member, mentioned
25
   changes to meeting dates for January, March, and April
```

22 1 to be posted on the website.] 2 3 [The Commission recessed from 2:02 p.m. until 4 2:13 p.m.] \* \* \* 5 6 [A formal hearing was held from 2:13 p.m. until 2:33 p.m. in the matter of the Petition for Reinstatement of Licensure of Shaheed Ali Sanders, Case No. 19-56-010456.] 10 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 11 12 2:33 p.m. the Commission entered into Executive 13 Session with Juan A. Ruiz, Esquire, Commission 14 Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial 15 deliberations on matters currently pending before the 16 Commission and to receive the advice of counsel. 17 Commission returned to open session at 2:40 p.m.] \* \* \* 18 19 MR. RUTZ: 2.0 The Commission was just in Executive 2.1 Session conducting deliberations on the 2.2 matter of the hearing for Reinstatement 2.3 Licensure of Shaheed Ali Sanders. 2.4 Is there a motion to grant 25 reinstatement to Shaheed Ali Sanders?

```
23
1
   MS. RUBIN:
2
                  So moved.
3
   MS. BARBIERI:
4
                   Second.
5
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
6
                  On the question, all in favor, say aye.
7
                  Any opposed?
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
9
10
   Adjournment
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
11
12
                  Do I have a motion to adjourn?
   MS. RUBIN:
13
14
                  So moved.
15
   MS. BARBIERI:
16
                  Second.
17
   CHAIR TARANTINO:
18
                  We're adjourned. Thank you everybody.
19
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
20
21
   [There being no further business, the State Real
22
   Estate Commission Meeting adjourned at 2:41 p.m.]
23
                               * * *
24
25
```

## 

### CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Real Estate Commission meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Real Estate Commission meeting.

Bridget Hockenbroch,

Minute Clerk

Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

			25
$\begin{smallmatrix} 1&2&3&4&5&6&7&8&9&0&1&2&3&4&5&6&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2&2$		STATE REAL ESTATE COMMISSION REFERENCE INDEX	
		September 10, 2019	
	TIME	AGENDA	
	11:30	Official Call to Order	
	11:30	Pledge of Allegiance	
	11:30	Roll Call	
	11:32	Approval of Minutes	
	11:32	Report of Prosecutorial Division	
	11:42	Report of Commission Counsel	
	11:42	Report of Commission Chair	
	11:43	Report of Acting Commissioner	
	11:45	Report of Commission Administrator	
	11:46	Public Session	
	11:50 1:52	Executive Session Return to Open Session	
	1:53	Motions	
	1:57	Report of Committees	
	2:02 2:13	Recess Return to Open Session	
	2:13	Miscellaneous	
40 41 42 43	2:13 2:33	Formal Hearing - Shaheed Ali Sanders	
43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50	2:33 2:40	Executive Session Return to Open Session	
	2:41	Adjournment	