1	
2	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
3	DEPARTMENT OF STATE
4	BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS
5	
6	
7	DRAFT MINUTES
8	
9	MEETING OF:
10	
11	STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC
12	
13	TIME: 10:33 A.M.
14	
15	PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE
16	2601 North Third Street
17	One Penn Center, Board Room C
18	Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110
19	
20	VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS
21	
22	December 29, 2022
23	
24	
25	

		2
-	4	
2	1	State Board of Chiropractic
3	2	
4		<u>December 29, 2022</u>
5		
6		
7		BOARD MEMBERS:
8		
9		Michael S. Swank, D.C., Chairperson
10		Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
11		Professional and Occupational Affairs
12		William D. Aukerman, D.C., Secretary
13		Ann R. Johnston, Senior Deputy Attorney General,
14		Office of Attorney General, Consumer Protection
15		Member
16		Doyle W. Young III, Public Member Jonathan W.
17		McCullough, D.C.
18		
19		
20		BUREAU PERSONNEL:
21		
22		Carole Clarke Smith, Esquire, Senior Board Counsel
23		Carolyn DeLaurentis, Deputy Chief Counsel,
24		Prosecution
25		Division
26		Heather J. McCarthy, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor
27		Tyesha C. Miley, Esquire, Board Counsel
28		Colby B. Widdowson, Esquire, Board Prosecution
29		Liaison
30		Garrett A. Rine, Esquire, Board Prosecutor
31		Sarah E. McNeill, Board Administrator
32		Shakeena Chappelle, Board Administrator
33		Amanda Richards, Fiscal Chief, Bureau of Finance and
34		Operations, Department of State
35		Michelle Witmer, Fiscal Management Specialist,
36		Bureau of Finance and Operations, Department of State
37		Jennifer Gage, Fiscal Management Specialist,
38		Department of State
39		Tamie Laudenslager, Fiscal Management Specialist,
40		Bureau of Finance and Operations, Department of

State Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Executive Policy Specialist, Department of State ALSO PRESENT: Keith Miller, D.C., President, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association State Board of Chiropractic <u>December 29</u>, 2022 ALSO PRESENT: (cont.) Jennifer Smeltz, Republican Executive Director, Senate Consumer Protection & Professional Licensure Committee Edward L. Nielsen, MHS, Executive Vice President, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association George E. Khoury, D.C., District III Director, Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards Ted Mowatt, CAE, Vice President, Wanner Associates, On behalf of the of the Chiropractor Fellowship of Pennsylvania Kyle Freeman Derek Jokelson, Esquire, Jokelson Law Group, P.C. Casey Phillips, D.C., Five Points Chiropractic & Wellness Amber Garbinski 

	4
80 81 82 83 84 85 86 87 88 89 90 91 92 93 94 95	
96 97	
98 99	
100	* * *
101	State Board of Chiropractic
102	December 29, 2022
103	* * *
104	[Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 9:30
105	a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session with Tyesha C.
106	Miley, Esquire, Board Counsel, to have attorney-client
107	consultations and for the purpose of conducting quasi-
108	judicial deliberations. The Board returned to open session
109	at 10:30 a.m.]
110	***
111	Official Call to Order

[Michael Swank, D.C., Chair, called the meeting of the State 112 113 Board of Chiropractic to order at 10:33 114 a.m.] \* \* \* 115 116 [Tyesha C. Miley, Esquire, Board Counsel, reminded everyone 117 the meeting was being held in relation to Act 100 of 2021, 118 which provides for virtual meetings, and the requirements of 119 the practice act, where each licensing board and commission 120 is required to use a virtual platform to conduct business 121 when a public meeting is held. 122 Ms. Miley noted the meeting was being recorded, and those 123 who continued to participate were giving their consent to be 124 recorded. 125 Ms. Miley also informed everyone that the Board met in 126 Executive Session to have attorney-client consultations and 127 for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.] 128 \* \* \* 129 Introduction of Board Members and Attendees [Michael Swank, 130 D.C., Chair, requested an introduction of Board members 131 and attendees.] 132 \* \* \* Approval of minutes of the October 6, 2022 meeting MS. 133 134 MILEY:

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

135 The Chair would entertain a motion to adopt 136 the meeting minutes from the regular October 137 6, 2022 meeting. 138 DR. AUKERMAN: 139 I would like to make a motion to approve the 140 draft minutes of October 6, 2022. 141 142 MS. MILEY: 143 Is there a second? 144 MS. JOHNSTON: 145 I second that motion. 146 MS. MILEY: 147 Is there any discussion of this? 148 Seeing none. 149 Ms. Chappelle, may we have a roll call 150 vote? 151 152 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 153 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 154 Young, abstain; Dr. 155 McCullough, abstain. 156 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 157 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion.] \* \* \* 158

6

159 Approval of minutes of the October 6, 2022 regulatory 160 meeting MS. MILEY: 161 162 The Chair would entertain a motion for the 163 adoption of the October 6 164 Regulatory Meeting Minutes. 165 Is there a motion? 166 DR. AUKERMAN: 167 I would like to make a motion to approve the 168 draft regulatory minutes of 169 October 6, 2022. 170 MS. MILEY: 171 Is there a second? 172 MS. JOHNSTON: 173 I second that motion. 174 MS. MILEY: 175 Is there any discussion? Hearing none. 176 177 Ms. Chappelle, read the roll call vote. 178 179 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, 180 abstain; Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle Young, abstain; Dr. McCullough, 181 182 abstain.

7

183 [The motion carried. Arion Claggett, Doyle Young, and 184 Jonathan McCullough abstained from voting on the motion.] \*\*\* 185 186 [Tyesha C. Miley, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted item 3 was 187 added to the agenda in error and has been withdrawn for 188 consideration.] \* \* \* 189 190 Report of Prosecution 191 [Colby B. Widdowson, Esquire, Board Prosecution 192 Liaison, presented the Consent Agreement for Case No. 193 22-43-005884.] CHAIR 194 SWANK: 195 Do we have a motion to accept the 196 agreement of Case No. 22-43-005884? 197 DR. AUKERMAN: 198 I make a motion to approve the Consent 199 Agreement and Order at Case No. 22-43-200 005884. 201 MS. JOHNSTON: 202 I second the motion. 203 MS. MILEY: 204 Any discussion? 205 CHAIR SWANK: 206 Can we have a vote?

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

207 208 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 209 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 210 Young, abstain; Dr. 211 McCullough, abstain. 212 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 213 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion. The 214 Respondent's name for Case No. 22-43-005884 is Linda 215 K. Molitoris, D.C.l 216 \* \* \* 217 [Heather J. McCarthy, Esquire, Senior Board 218 Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for Case 219 No. 21-43-003278.] CHAIR 220 SWANK: 221 Motion to accept the agreement? 2.2.2 DR. AUKERMAN: 223 I make a motion to accept the Consent 224 Agreement and Order at Case No. 21-43-225 003278. 226 MS. JOHNSTON: 227 I second that motion. 228 MS. MILEY: 229 Is there any discussion? Hearing none. 230 CHAIR SWANK:

9

231 Call for a vote. 232 233 Dr. Swank, yes; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 234 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 235 Young, abstain; Dr. 236 McCullough, abstain. 237 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 2.38 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion. The Respondent's name for Case No. 21-43-003278 is 239 240 Gregory Thomas White Jr., D.C.] 241 \* \* \* 242 [Heather J. McCarthy, Esquire, Senior Board 243 Prosecutor, on behalf of Andrea L. Costello, Esquire, Board Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for 244 245 Case No. 21-43-016307.] 246 CHAIR SWANK: 247 Motion to accept the agreement? 248 DR. AUKERMAN: 249 I make a motion to approve the Consent 250 Agreement and Order at Case No. 22-43-251 016307. 252 MS. JOHNSTON: 253 I second that motion. 254 MS. MILEY:

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

11 255 Any discussion? 256 CHAIR SWANK: 257 I call for a vote on item 6 at Case No. 258 22-43-016307. 259 260 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 2.61 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 2.62 Young, abstain; Dr. 263 McCullough, abstain. 264 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 265 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion.] \* \* \* 266 267 [Garrett A. Rine, Esquire, Board Prosecutor, presented the 268 Consent Agreement for Case No. 20-43-003588.1 269 270 CHAIR SWANK: 271 Do we have a motion to accept the agreement? 272 DR. AUKERMAN: 273 I'll make a motion to approve the Consent 274 Agreement and Order at Case No. 275 20-43-003588. 276 MS. JOHNSTON: 277 I second that motion. 278 MS. MILEY:

12 279 Any discussion? 280 CHAIR SWANK: 2.81 Call for the vote. 2.82 283 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 284 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 285 Young, abstain; Dr. 286 McCullough, abstain. [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 287 288 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion. The 289 Respondent at Case No. 20-43-003588 is Warren T. 290 Eichhorn, D.C.l 291 \* \* \* 292 Appointment - Bureau of Finance and Operations 293 Annual Budget Presentation 294 [Amanda Richards, Chief of Fiscal Management, Bureau of 295 Finance and Operations, Department of State, referred to 296 licensee population over the past seven years, noting the 297 Board had 4,011 licensees in FY2122 and 3,798 licensees as 298 of the time of the report, showing a decrease of 213 299 licensees. 300 Ms. Richards provided a four-year history of the 301 chiropractor license class. She reported a small decrease 302 in licensees from renewal FY20-21 at 3,839 and FY22-23 at

303 3,798 licensees, noting the decrease to be normal but that 304 the Bureau of Finance and Operations (BFO) would watch it to 305 make sure there is not anything significant going forward. 306 Ms. Richards addressed revenue and stated it is reviewed on 307 a biennial basis. She reported on the revenue for FY20-21 308 and FY21-22, noting the biennial total. She noted 97 309 percent of revenue is made up of renewals and applications. 310 She stated that revenue is received from other categories 311 but is not consistent. She mentioned the Board approved a 312 biennial renewal fee increase in February 2022 to increase 313 the license renewal fee to \$225 in FY24-25, \$241 in FY26-27, 314 and \$258 in FY28-29. 315 Ms. Richards noted the two main categories when reviewing 316 expenses are administrative and legal costs. She stated 317 that expenses are brought in through direct charges, 318 timesheet-based charges, and licensee population. She 319 referred to the expenses in FY20-21, FY21-22, and at the 320 time of the report on 321 December 16, 2022. She noted the budgeted amount for FY22-322 23 is adequate. She stated BFO is projecting a decrease in

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

things back up to a positive balance.]

the out years but is also taking into account the new fee

increase going into effect in FY24-25, which should bring

\* \* \*

323

324

325

327 Report of Acting Commissioner - No Report 328 \*\*\* Report 329 of Board Counsel 330 MS. MILEY: 331 For the consideration of the members today, I have agenda item 8, an Adjudication and 332 333 Order pertaining to Case No. 22-43-005206. 334 335 CHAIR SWANK: 336 Do we have a motion to accept? 337 DR. AUKERMAN: 338 I'll make a motion to accept the 339 Proposed Adjudication and Order. 340 MS. JOHNSTON: 341 I move to second that motion. 342 MS. MILEY: 343 Is there any discussion? 344 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT: 345 Shakeena, could we have a roll call, please? 346 347 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 348 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 349 Young, abstain; Dr. 350 McCullough, abstain.

14

351 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 352 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion. The 353 Respondent's name is Michael E. Seldow, D.C. at Case 354 No. 22-43-005206.1 355 \*\*\* Report 356 of Regulatory Board Counsel 357 MS. MILEY: 358 The next item on the agenda are the proposed 359 regulations pertaining to fees for the 360 Chiropractic Board at 16A-4335. At this 361 time, the Chair will entertain a motion to 362 approve the proposed regulation, which 363 includes the preamble and annex, of 16A-4335 364 relating to fees and direct Board Counsel to 365 move the proposed rulemaking through the 366 regulatory process. 367 Is there such a motion? DR. 368 AUKERMAN: 369 I'll make a motion to approve regulation 370 16A-4335, the proposed fee regulation. 371 MS. MILEY: 372 Is there a second? 373 MS. JOHNSTON: 374 I'll second that.

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

375 MS. MILEY: 376 Is there any discussion? Hearing none. 377 May we have a roll call vote, Ms. 378 Chappelle? 379 380 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 381 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 382 Young, abstain; Dr. 383 McCullough, abstain. 384 [The motion carried. Doyle Young and Jonathan 385 McCullough abstained from voting on the motion.] 386 \* \* \* 387 Report of Board Chair 388 [Michael Swank, D.C., Chair, thanked new Board members, Dr. 389 McCullough and Doyle Young. He noted being pleased with 390 having the new Board members but also mentioned the Board 391 has openings for one professional member and one public member and is still looking for additional applicants.] 392 \*\*\* 393 394 Report of Board Administrator 395 [Shakeena Chappelle, requested the Board's approval for the 396 proposed 2024 Board meeting dates of February 397 8, April 18, June 13, August 15, October 17, and 398 December 17.]

399 CHAIR SWANK: 400 I request a motion. 401 DR. AUKERMAN: 402 I'll make a motion to approve the 2024 403 meeting dates just discussed for 404 February through December. 405 MS. JOHNSTON: 406 I move to second that. 407 CHAIR SWANK: 408 Call for a vote to approve the 2024 dates. 409 410 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 411 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 412 Young, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye. 413 [The motion carried unanimously.] \*\*\* 414 415 Old Business 416 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Secretary, addressed his 417 attendance at a Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards 418 Meeting December 5-6. He stated many boards have the same 419 type of problems with boundary violations, fraud, substance 420 abuse, and unprofessional conduct. 421 Dr. Aukerman addressed states having new licensees attend 422 in-person and online Board meetings, noting some states are

17

423 giving new licensees credit up to 8 hours for attending 424 board meetings depending on the state. He commented that 425 this helps the licensee understand what the Board can and 426 cannot do and believe it is something Pennsylvania needs to 427 entertain in the future.

Dr. Aukerman mentioned there was also discussion of Board
members receiving training for trauma victims abused by
licensees. He noted End Violence Against Women
International (EVAWI) was a good resource for Board members
to better understand victims of violence and domestic abuse.

433 Dr. Aukerman noted discussions on Special 434 Purposes Examination for Chiropractic (SPEC) and how that 435 pertains to people reinstituting their license. He 436 addressed discussions on using a matrix for decision-making, 437 including pulling licenses and suspending licenses. He 438 reported having a copy that could be entertained at the next 439 Board meeting to help better understand discipline and Board 440 actions.] \* \* \* 441 442 New Business - Annual Election of Officers 443 CHAIR SWANK: 444 We have new business next, which would be

the annual election of officers for

446 nominations for 2023. Who would like to 447 open that nomination process? 448 DR. AUKERMAN: I would like to run for Chairman in 2023. 449 I've been on this Board for almost seven 450 451 years and have a good feel what's going on 452 in the state and other states by attending 453 the Chiropractic 454 Licensing Board Meetings. 455 CHAIR SWANK: 456 Any additional nominations for Chair? 457 Any additional nominations for any 458 other Board positions? 459 MR. YOUNG: 460 I'd like to nominate Dr. McCullough for 461 secretary. 462 CHAIR SWANK: 463 additional nominations for Any 464 secretary? Seeing none. Any 465 additional nominations for any 466 additional officers on the Board? 467 Seeing none.

I'd like to close the nominations at 468 469 this time then. Can we have a vote on those 470 nominations? [Casey Phillips, D.C., Five Points Chiropractic & 471 472 Wellness, wanted to nominate someone for the open Board 473 member position. Commissioner Johnson explained that he 474 could not nominate someone to join the Board but would 475 follow up with him offline.] CHAIR SWANK: 476 477 The motion for nominees for Chairman is Dr. 478 William Aukerman and the additional 479 nomination of Dr. Jonathan McCullough for 480 secretary. No additional nominations seen. I call for a vote on Dr. Aukerman 481 482 for Chairman. 483 DR. AUKERMAN: 484 I move to make a motion to accept the 485 chairmanship for 2023 of the State 486 Board of Chiropractic. 487 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 488 Second. 489 MS. MILEY: 490 Attorney Johnston will second. 491 MS. JOHNSTON:

21 492 I second that motion. 493 MS. MILEY: 494 Any discussion? 495 CHAIR SWANK: 496 I call for the roll vote for Dr. Aukerman to be nominated for Chair in 497 498 2023. 499 500 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 501 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 502 Young, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye. 503 [The motion carried unanimously.] 504 \* \* \* 505 CHAIR SWANK: 506 I call for the motion to accept the 507 nomination of Dr. McCullough for secretary. 508 DR. AUKERMAN: 509 I'll make a motion to proceed with the 510 nomination of Dr. McCullough for secretary 511 of the state Board for 2023. 512 MS. 513 JOHNSTON: 514 I second that motion. 515 MS. MILEY:

516 Any discussion? Seeing none. CHAIR 517 SWANK: 518 I call for the vote on Secretary 519 Jonathan McCullough for 2023. 520 521 Dr. Swank, aye; Commissioner Claggett, aye; 522 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Doyle 523 Young, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye. 524 [The motion carried unanimously.] \*\*\* 525 526 Appointment - Prosecution Division Annual Report 527 Presentation 528 [Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of 529 Professional and Occupational Affairs, informed Board 530 members that Ms. DeLaurentis would not be presenting today 531 after speaking with her but would be presenting sometime in 532 2023.1 533 \* \* \* Public Comment 534 [Edward Nielsen, MHS, Executive Vice President, Pennsylvania 535 536 Chiropractic Association, expressed concern with some of the 537 penalties for doctors that the Board approved a couple of 538 months ago and believed they are grossly out of line with a 539 lot of the other health care professionals.

Keith Miller, D.C., President, Pennsylvania
Chiropractic Association, stated the Pennsylvania
Chiropractic Association (PCA) has concerns regarding 27
violations that chiropractors can be guilty of but not
medical doctors (MDs) and doctors of osteopathic medicine
(DOs).

546 Mr. Miller commented that PCA believed those 27 crimes 547 should be applied to the other health professions as well or 548 chiropractors should not be subject to those and all health 549 care professionals should be held to the same standard. He 550 asked whether the Board, representatives of the Office of 551 Attorney General (OAG), or other departments have some kind 552 of comment or an explanation as to why the chiropractic 553 profession has been singled out much more heavy-handed than 554 every other health profession in Pennsylvania.

555 Carole Clarke Smith, Esquire, Senior Board 556 Counsel, commented that PCA is referring to Act 53, noting 557 the public comment period just ended, and it would be 558 premature for the Board to comment on any of the comments 559 received because they have not seen them. 560 Ms. Clarke Smith informed everyone that the Board would be 561 looking at all of the comments received specific to the 562 Chiropractic Board at a future meeting. She mentioned that 563 each board is its own board and its practice and patient

interaction is different. She noted each board came up with
its own list and that the bureau, as a whole, would be
responding to comments on the final regulation, but this
Board specifically would take up any comments related to its
specific list of crimes when those comments are placed on
the agenda.

570 Mr. Miller requested, as the Pennsylvania Chiropractic 571 Association representing a large percentage of the licensees 572 in the state, the Board look at their comments and 573 discrepancies between doctors of chiropractic scope licenses 574 on Act 53 and other health care boards and suggested they 575 make them equal or fair. He commented that there are 576 certain things that are scope-specific but PCA believed that 577 27 is heavy-handed and singlehandedly punishes the 578 profession on a much higher standard. 579 Ms. Miley referred to a comment by Mr. Nielsen and provided 580 clarification that the specific offenses had been previously 581 approved and published on the 582 State Board of Chiropractic's website since December 583 2020 and not a couple of months ago.] \*\*\* 584 585 Adjournment

586 CHAIR SWANK:

587

I'll entertain a motion for adjournment.

588 DR. AUKERMAN: 589 I'll make a motion to adjourn the meeting. 590 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 591 I will second that. \*\*\* 592 [There being no further business, the State Board of 593 594 Chiropractic Meeting adjourned at 11:40 a.m.] \*\*\* 595 596 597 CERTIFICATE 598 599 I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the 600 State Board of Chiropractic meeting, was reduced to writing 601 by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes 602 accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of 603 Chiropractic meeting. 604 Auch Saluch 605 606 Amber Garbinski, 607 Minute Clerk 608 Sargent's Court Reporting 609 Service, Inc. 610

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

			26
			20
611			
612			
012			
613			
614			
014			
615			
C1 C			
616			
617			
C1 0			
618			
619			
620	1		STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC
621	2		REFERENCE INDEX
622	3		
623	4		December 29, 2022
624	5		
625	6	TIME	AGENDA
626	7		
627	8	9:30	Executive Session
628	9	10:30	Return to Open Session
629	10		1
630	11	10:33	Official Call to Order
631	12		
632	13	10:34	Introduction of Board Members/Attendees
633	14		
634		10:36	Approval of Minutes
635			
636		10:40	Report of Prosecution
637			
638		11:02	Appointment - Bureau of Finance and
639			Operations Annual Budget Presentation
640			
641		11:09	Report of Board Counsel
642			
643		11:13	Report of Board Chair
644			

			2.1
645	11:14	Report of Board Administrator	
646 647	11:18	Old Business	
648 649	11:22	New Business	
650			
651 652	11:31	Public Comment	
653	11:40	Adjournment	
654 655			
656 657			
658			
659 660			
661 662			
663			
664 665			
666 667			
668			
669			